

EFFECT OF CHANNELS FOR CASHLESS ECONOMY ON ENTREPRENEURSHIP DEVELOPMENT IN ANAMBRA STATE, NIGERIA

Cosmas Anayochukwu Nwankwo, University of KwaZulu-Natal
Uchechukwu Solomon Eze, Nnamdi Azikiwe University
MacDonald Isaac Kanyangale, University of KwaZulu-Natal

ABSTRACT

The objective of this study was to examine the effect of channels for the cashless economy on entrepreneurship development in Anambra State, Nigeria. This descriptive study explores internet banking services, automated teller machines and crowdfunding as the explanatory/independent variables, while the dependent variable was entrepreneurship development. The study population was 3,574 owner-managers of manufacturing small and medium enterprises in Anambra State, Nigeria. A sample of three hundred and four (344) owner-managers was selected using a simple random sampling technique. Data collected through structured questionnaires were analyzed using correlation analysis and multiple regression analysis. Results show that internet banking services, automated teller machine services, and crowdfunding positively affect entrepreneurship development. The study concluded that channels for a cashless economy have a significant and positive effect on entrepreneurship development. The study recommends that an integrated and intensive campaign is critical to sensitize the citizenry on the benefits of various channels for the cashless economy on business performance and survival as well as customer satisfaction. Additionally, the campaign should be reinforced by adequate security mechanisms, user-friendly service, and reliable ATMs, with affordable fees and features that allow customers to make deposits. Implications of study and areas for future research are highlighted.

Keywords: Entrepreneurship Development, Cashless Economy, Internet Banking Services, Automated Teller Machine Service, Crowd funding.

INTRODUCTION

Technology is critical for business activities and the survival of small and medium enterprises (SMEs), especially in the 21st century and cashless society. There are various benefits of a cashless economy in Nigeria for different stakeholders to pursue business and interactions electronically (Nwani et al., 2020). For instance, the cashless economy offers increased convenience for customers as they can access their bank accounts and transact on non-working days. For businesses, cashless economy helps to reduce exposure to the risk of cash-related crimes and armed robberies. It also makes payments from any location without physically visiting the bank (Nwani et al., 2020). In Nigeria, it is now possible for people to enjoy banking services with their smartphones without even being account holders (Ohiani, 2020). For businesses, the cashless economy has a significant increase in sales. Customer purchases are no

longer determined by the amount in the wallet but based on how much funds is in the accounts. The cashless economy gives SMEs the benefit of immediacy as e-payment options are instant.

In SMEs, immediacy in receiving payment helps improve cash flow. It reduces the pressure from waiting for cheques to clear and the 30-day invoicing. Efficiency arises from cashless and contactless payments, which take less time than cash payments (Nwani et al., 2020). At the corporation level, the benefits of a cashless economy include the reduction of the risk of both internal and external theft and the cost of cash handling (Nwani et al., 2020). A culture that supports a cashless system and the use of e-payment increases the profitability and growth of companies as it widens the customer base for large and SMEs. Innovative digital payment solutions are helpful for SMEs and corporations in Nigeria to adopt new ways of operating and gain competitive advantages or an edge over some of their competitors. In 2012, The Central Bank of Nigeria (CBN) adopted the cashless economy policy in line with the global trend of cashless payments. The new policy on cash-based transactions stipulates a cash handling charge on daily cash withdrawals or cash deposits that exceed N150,000 for Individuals and N1,000,000 for Corporate bodies. The new policy aims at reducing (not eliminating) the amount of physical cash (coins and notes) circulating in the economy. The policy also encourages more electronic-based transactions (payments for goods, services, transfers) (CBN, 2012). The CBN introduced the cashless policy to enable economic growth and increase financial inclusion by providing more efficient transaction options that result in a broader reach in Nigeria. Despite the introduction of the cashless policy in 2012, the use of cash in carrying out transactions has remained relatively high in Nigeria. In Nigeria, the cash-based economy is about the need to hold physically, touch and display money (Agwu & Agumadu, 2016).

Generally, there are many notable challenges related to implementing the cashless policy in Nigeria (Nwani et al., 2020). These include socio-cultural challenges such as the tendency of honouring people who show off physical cash rather than issue cheque gifts in celebrations like weddings, birthdays, and festivals. Customer-related challenges include illiterate customers and a lack of knowledge to effectively and securely use technology. Infrastructure-related challenges include epileptic power supply, poor internet network, while telecommunication infrastructure includes inadequate financial infrastructure to support the policy of a cashless economy (Nwani et al., 2020). Frequent system downtime, high charges on E-transactions, delays in reversing a wrong debit entry into a customer account and poor security impede the implementation of the cashless policy at the bank level. Against the backdrop of the above issues, the current study seeks to investigate the effect of non-cash payment through internet banking and ATM and crowdfunding on entrepreneurship development in manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State in Nigeria.

Statement of the Problem

The steady and growing stream of research on the influence of the cashless economy on entrepreneurship development in Nigeria is predominantly focusing on internet banking, ATM services and mobile banking while excluding new entrepreneurial financing mechanisms of crowd funding (Nwani et al., 2020; Onyekwelu & Nnabugwu, 2018; Okeke, 2017). Most of the recent research on the cashless economy and entrepreneurship development in Nigeria have investigated internet banking, ATM and mobile banking services as part of channels for the cashless economy but excluded Crowd funding (Onyekwelu & Nnabugwu, 2018; Okeke, 2017).

This gap in scholarly research is surprising as one of the significant obstacles to entrepreneurship development is access to finance. Within Anambra state, studies on the influence of the cashless economy on SME performance that have excluded the entrepreneurial developmental effect of crowdfunding include the work of Onyekwelu & Nnabugwu (2018) and Okeke (2017). The few studies in Nigeria which have recognized crowdfunding as a key financing mechanism have adopted a macroeconomic perspective. In this regard, they have focused on the impact of ATM transaction value, point of sales terminal, internet banking and crowdfunding transaction value on economic growth (Okereke, 2016). Entrepreneurship scholars are interested to understand the dynamics of successful crowdfunding, distribution and use of crowdfunding mechanisms by entrepreneurs at the start-up, growth or mature stage of the enterprise. Furthermore, there is also a scholarly need to fathom the effect of innovation, proactiveness, risk-taking, and personal networks in sourcing funds for business from the crowd rather than just the people in Nigeria (Böckel et al., 2021).

Instead, we know more about macro-level issues and effects of cashless policy (Ochiabuto, 2016; Mpho, 2017); challenges related to the implementation of the policy (Taiwo, Ayo, Afieroho & Agwu, 2016), and measures to avoid negative impact and failure of SMEs due to the cashless policy in Nigeria (Elechi & Rufus, 2016). It is equally notable that research findings on the effect of a cashless economy on entrepreneurship development are contradictory in Nigeria. For example, Igbara et al. (2015) concluded that the cashless economy negatively impacted existing small-scale businesses in the service sector in Ogoni land in Nigeria. SMEs in this study were described as having a meagre income, very poor banking habits and less reliance on heavy capital outlay. These SMEs found Information, Communication and Technology (ICT), bank transactions, ATMs usage and online banking insignificant to them (Igbara et al., 2015). These findings contradict studies by Onyekwelu & Nnabugwu (2018) and Okeke (2017) in Anambra state. These scholars found that internet/online banking, ATM and mobile banking services have a positive and significant effect on the performance of micro, small and medium enterprises (MSMEs) in Anambra State, Nigeria. Onyekwelu & Nnabugwu 2018 (2018) caution that only the MSMEs who can avail the opportunities of non-cash payment will benefit and grow their businesses provided by using the channels for a cashless economy. Okeke (2017) is clear that there is a need to create more awareness about the usefulness of cashless practices for SMEs to perform better. There are conflicting results and exclusion of crowdfunding in previous research. It is compelling for future research to bring together usage and access to internet banking, ATM and crowdfunding together and examine their influence on entrepreneurship development. The current study is valuable as it seeks to fill this scholarly gap by focusing on how internet banking, ATM services and crowdfunding affect the entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs.

Objectives of the Study

The main objective of the quantitative study is to examine the effect of channels for the cashless economy on entrepreneurship development in Anambra State, Nigeria. The specific objectives include to:

1. Examine the influence of internet banking on the entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State.

2. Determine the effect of automated teller machines (ATMs) on entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State Evaluate the influence of crowdfunding on entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State.

Hypotheses

The following hypotheses stated in null form guided this study.

- H₀₁: Internet banking services has no significant effect on the entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State*
- H₀₂: ATM has no significant effect on the entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State*
- H₀₃: Crowdfunding services has no significant effect on the entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State*

LITERATURE REVIEW

Cashless Economy

The term “*cashless society*” is associated with Reistad (1967), who used it to mean a society in which electronic funds transfer takes over the place of paper currency. Efficient electronic payments initiated by various types of plastic cards replace coins and notes. The concept of a cashless economy entails a drastic reduction in cash handling for transaction purposes to rely more on sending an electronic signal to banks for the payment and receipt of money on one's behalf in the process of exchange (Aremu et al., 2015). However, a cashless economy does not assert that the use of cash will be eradicated but instead is limited to the barest minimum for carrying out financial transactions (Aremu et al., 2015). In essence, a cashless economy means that a country transitions from a cash-based economic model to a cashless economic model. A cashless economy combines cash-based and electronic payment systems, with the latter exceeding the former in utilization (Kumar & Bansal, 2019). It minimizes the use of physical cash by providing alternative channels for making payments. The electronic transaction is a sine qua non to implementing a cashless economy (Aremu et al., 2015). As there are various modes of electronic payments, this study focuses only on internet banking, ATM and Crowdfunding. The CBN Annual Report for 2017 reveals that the ATM, as the most patronized e-payment transaction, accounted for 78.2% of the transactions. Internet banking is a prerequisite to connect and pay customers, suppliers, other business stakeholders within and outside Nigeria electronically in a cashless economy. The study includes crowdfunding as it can address the challenges of sourcing funds for new ventures and novel ideas.

Internet Banking

Internet banking refers to an internet portal through which customers can use different banking services ranging from bill payments to making investments online Agwu & Agumadu (2016). It enables enterprises to access their accounts and general information on bank products and services through banks websites (Onyekwelu & Nnabugwu, 2018; Nwankwo & Ifejiofor, 2018). In Kenya, Kombe & Wafula (2015) found a positive impact of internet banking on the

financial performance of financial institutions. A study by Ohiani (2020) shows that innovation adoption, service quality, and cybercrime have a significant relationship with the competitiveness of banks and the perception of customers towards online services in Nigeria. New technologies transform how SMEs operate and add value to both existing and new markets (Nwankwo et al., 2019). It is also crucial in creating opportunities that expand the firms beyond the current size of operation, range of activities and geography. However, educated and uneducated customers in Nigeria still fear that cybercrime is predominantly committed via e-banking platforms (Ohiani, 2020). Insecurity is a significant threat to e-transactions because of its potential to cause financial risks, illegitimate access to customers' identity details and losses to banks (Onyekwelu & Nnabugwu, 2018). This study focuses on technology innovation, service quality, cyber security and internet applicability as dimensions of internet helpful banking to understand the effect of internet banking on entrepreneurship.

Autoteller Machines (ATM)

The ATM serves as a computerized telecommunications device that provides the customers of a financial institution with access to financial transactions in a public space without the need for human interactions with bank officials (Onyekwelu & Nnabugwu, 2018). Clients of a financial institution have access to financial transactions for 24 hours/7 days and account balance enquiries at an ATM (Ali & Emenike, 2016). ATM services have become a great facilitator of quick small cash withdrawals and transfers. It has brought a lot of ease in business operations, especially for the small businesses in Nigeria. Furthermore, ATMs also sell recharge cards of all networks and make transfers across all banks (Onyekwelu & Nnabugwu, 2018). In Nigeria, Ali & Emenike (2016) reported a positive impact of ATMs on banking service delivery (Omotayo and Dahunsi, 2015).

Fraudsters often dupe the less-educated customers via their ATM cards. Banks need to ensure that ATM services balance the quality of customer services on the one hand and accessibility, convenience, innovation, speed, and security. Customers still worry about online banking and ATM insecurity based on what they hear and read in the tabloids about cybercrimes (Agwu & Agumadu, 2016). This study focused on onsite ATM, offsite ATM, and bio-metric ATM to understand the effect of ATM services on entrepreneurship development. Onsite ATM is the ATM installed within the bank premises. Onsite ATM is always helpful for the customers who frequently visit the branch. Offsite ATM refers to the installation of ATM facilities at places that are the center of business, railway stations, hospitals, markets, and big institutions located far away from the bank branch. Bio-metric ATMs accommodate illiterate persons who cannot read the instructions on the ATM screen and use their thumb or fingerprints in place of a PIN for availing banking business.

Crowdfunding

Crowd funding is a new way of entrepreneurial financing or getting seed capital for new ideas and projects. It is critical to address the finance barrier for entrepreneurs and encourage innovation and new venture creation (Böckel et al., 2021). Mollick (2014) defines crowdfunding as *“the efforts by entrepreneurial individuals and groups—cultural, social, and for-profit—to fund their ventures by drawing on relatively small contributions from a relatively large number of individuals, using the internet, without standard financial intermediaries”*. Crowdfunding is

entrepreneurial and relates to a “crowd” rather than one or two major investors funding a project or business. It is typified as an internet-based and peer-to-peer open call to provide financial resources (Jovanović, 2019). Social capital in terms of personal networks and underlying project quality is associated with successful raising funds on the crowdfunding platform. In crowdfunding, it is vital that the entrepreneurs signal preparedness to potential funders and set appropriate goals to deliver a product on time and achieve significantly more funding than requested (Petruzzi et al., 2019). There are four different types of crowdfunding. First, donation-based funding is when contributors give money to a campaign, company or person without receiving anything in return. Second, equity funding, also called crowd investing is where backers get shares in the business (Petruzzi et al., 2019). Third, debt-based funding or crowd lending involve backers whose money is repaid with interest. Money pledged by backers is a loan to be repaid with interest by a specific deadline. Lastly, reward-based funding is when contributors receive tokens, products or services in return for their donations. The rewards vary by the size of the donation, which incentivizes higher contributions (Petruzzi et al., 2019). Reward-based crowdfunding is the most frequently used form of crowdfunding. Crowdfunding can also serve marketing purposes (e.g. increasing attention among potential customers, the general public, and the media) (Böckel et al., 2021). In a cashless economy, the aspect of how crowdfunding develops entrepreneurship is understudied. This study focused on identifying opportunities for entrepreneurial funding, quality of project ideas; interactions with funders; building personal networks and social capital, managing project and accountability to funders as aspects of crowdfunding related to entrepreneurship.

Entrepreneurship Development

The opportunity-based view of entrepreneurship is common in literature. This view emphasizes the aspect of opportunity recognition, assessment and exploitation in an enterprise. Opportunities refer to “*situations in which new goods, services, raw materials, markets and organizing methods can be introduced through the formation of new means, ends, or means-ends relationships*” (Eckhardt & Shane, 2003). More importantly, an entrepreneurial opportunity is a chance to meet a market need through some creative combination of resources to deliver superior value. Schumpeterian view of innovation embraces five instances of the creative combination of resources related to the new goods, new production method, new market, new source of supply of raw materials, and new organization (Schumpeter, 1934). Non-cash payments and crowdfunding can create a variety of means-ends relationships, which may be opportunities for innovative operations and funding of SMEs in a cashless economy.

Soyibo (2016) see “*entrepreneurship as the process of identifying an opportunity related to needs satisfaction and converting it to a product or service of value*”. The entrepreneurship process is the desire to innovate, be proactive and take calculated risks in producing new things (goods and services) or improving existing ones and profiting from them. The usage and access to cashless modes of payment may induce unconventional thinking not limited by the constraints of the systems in place but rather by challenging those systems and traditions with fresh ideas and techniques of creating value in a cashless economy. Innovativeness is the propensity to support and implement creativity, new ideas and experiment processes that may result in new products, services, or technological processes (Nwankwo & Kanyangale, 2020). Non-cash payment has the potential of affecting internal systems and processes and ideas of how to operate

SMEs. Proactiveness reflects the tendency to scan the external environment actively, predict unexpected shocks, and prepare for future uncertainty. An enterprise needs to anticipate future needs and changes in customers' payment behaviours pursue new opportunities and be strategic in introducing innovations. In crowdfunding, proactiveness relates to the initiation of collaboration and interaction with stakeholders such as funders (Ajagbe & Ismail, 2014). Akanwa & Akpanabia (2012) argued that entrepreneurship is the willingness and ability of an individual to seek out investment opportunities, establish and run an enterprise successfully. Risk-taking is the propensity to commit resources to the uncertain and novel business. The variety of risks that an entrepreneur may encounter includes business risks, financial risks and personal risks. Ajagbe & Ismail (2014) posit that *“entrepreneurship is viewed as the capability and attitude of an individual or team of people to implement new ventures ideas with the possibility of success or failures”*. In understanding entrepreneurship development, it is crucial to focus on how the individual identifies an opportunity and engages in proactiveness, innovativeness, and risk-taking activities.

At the enterprise level, developing entrepreneurship also entails identifying and exploiting a favourable set of suitable or conducive circumstances for a new enterprise or operating in a new way. Nwafor (2017) sees entrepreneurship development as the most effective method for creating new enterprises and bringing new products and services to the market. However, entrepreneurship need not involve anything new from a global or even national perspective, but rather the adoption of new forms of business organizations, new technologies and new enterprises producing goods not previously available at a location (Okeke & Nwankwo, 2017). In this study, entrepreneurship is unpacked by focusing on innovation, competitive aggression and calculate-risk taking. It is interesting to explore how internet banking, ATM and crowdfunding as channels for the cashless economy in Nigeria influence the elements of entrepreneurship.

METHODOLOGY

The study adopted a positivistic paradigm and descriptive research design to focus on owner-managers of manufacturing SMEs registered with Cooperate Affairs Commission in Anambra State. The total population comprises 2093. The statistical formula devised was employed to determine the sample size of 404 owner-managers in the manufacturing sector who were selected using a random sampling technique. A structured questionnaire containing closed-ended questions was used to get the views and opinions of owner-managers on how internet banking, ATM and Crowdfunding affect entrepreneurship. The key dimensions measured in relation to the influence of internet banking were technology innovation, service quality, cyber security, and internet applicability. The effect of ATM on entrepreneurship was delineated through the dimensions of onsite ATM, offsite ATM, and bio-metric ATM. The effect of crowdfunding on entrepreneurship was delineated through the dimensions of identifying opportunities for entrepreneurial funding; Quality of project ideas, interactions with funders; building of personal networks and social capital; managing projects and accountability to funders. The dimensions measured in this study regarding entrepreneurship development included innovation, competitive aggression and calculated risk-taking. The Likert rating scale was used in the instrument. The questionnaire was pre-tested on a small group similar to one in the study to check its validity and reliability. The instrument was both face and content validated,

while the internal consistency was realized at 0.723, indicating that it is a good fit for the study. The researcher used the test-retest method to test the reliability of the research instruments. Out of 404 questionnaires distributed to the owner-managers, 344 were filled correctly and found useful, while 34 were not properly filled and 16 copies were missing. As such, the analysis was based on the 344 duly filled questionnaires. Data from the questionnaire were coded and entered into the computer using Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS Version 26) for analysis. Entrepreneurship development was regressed against the three independent variables of a cashless economy using the Multiple Regression Analysis (MRA).

RESULTS

The results are presented based on each of the three channels for cashless economy:

Effect of Internet Banking Services on Entrepreneurship Development of Manufacturing SMEs

The null hypothesis states that internet banking services have no significant effect on the entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State. To test the relationship between internet banking and entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State of Nigeria, this paper employed the Pearson's correlation coefficient and multiple regressions analysis. The Pearson's correlation coefficient was used to ascertain the relationship between the overall dimensions of internet banking and entrepreneurship development, while multiple regressions analysis was used to ascertain the contribution of each dimension of internet banking to entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs. Therefore, Table 1 illustrates the correlation coefficient between these variables.

Table 1 PEARSON'S CORRELATION BETWEEN INTERNET BANKING AND ENTREPRENEURSHIP DEVELOPMENT			
Variables		Internet banking	Entrepreneurship development
Internet banking	Pearson's Correlation	1	527**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		0.000
	N	344	344
Entrepreneurship development	Pearson's Correlation	527**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	0.000	
	N	344	344

Note: ** Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Table 1 reveals the correlation coefficient between internet banking and entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs ($r=0.527$, $p<0.05$). The correlation coefficient table shows that internet banking is positively and significantly correlated with entrepreneurship. The p-value is lower than 0.05, and the correlation coefficient is 0.527 or 52.7%. With this level of significance, the null hypothesis was rejected. Further tests were carried out using multiple regressions analysis to ascertain the individual contribution of each dimension of internet banking on entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in the Anambra State of Nigeria. Table 2 below shows the result in the model summary, ANOVA and coefficients:

Table 2 MODEL SUMMARY OF REGRESSION				
Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	0.649 ^a	0.613	0.562	3.67231

Note: a. Predictors: (Constant), technology innovation, service quality, cyber security, internet applicability

The model summary in Table 2 above represented the regression coefficient as 'R' at 0.649 or 64.9%. This reveals that a relationship exists between the dependent and independent variables. The coefficient of determination represented by " R^2 " with a value of 0.613 or 61.3% shows the level of variation in the dependent variable. This means that 61.3% of the variability of entrepreneurship development in the manufacturing SME sector in Anambra State was jointly accounted for by the predictor variables of technology innovation, service quality, cyber security and internet applicability.

Table 3 SUMMARY OF ANALYSIS OF VARIANCE (ANOVA)					
Model	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1 Regression	177.612	4	177.612	34.871	0.000 ^b
Residual	664.135	259	7.141		
Total	841.747	263			

Note: a. Dependent Variable: entrepreneurship development

b. Predictors: (Constant), technology innovation, service quality, cyber security, internet applicability

Table 3 above show that the F value is at 34.871, and the sig level is at 0.000, which is lesser than 0.05. This implies that the model is significant and good for prediction.

Table 4 SUMMARY OF REGRESSION COEFFICIENTS, t-VALUE AND PROBABILITY LEVEL					
Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
	β	Std. Error	Beta		
1 (Constant)	6.423	1.366		4.743	0.000
Technology innovation	0.322	0.061	0.321	3.589	0.000
Service quality	0.537	0.045	0.429	4.109	0.002
Cyber security	0.138	0.085	0.246	1.733	0.004
Internet applicability	0.403	0.068	0.415	4.031	0.000

Note: a. Dependent Variable: Entrepreneurship development

The regression model shows the contribution of internet banking in the prediction of entrepreneurship development in the manufacturing SME sector in Anambra State of Nigeria. As regression weight indicates the relative contribution of each of the internet banking variables, the result in Table 4 shows that service quality which is one of the internet banking dimensions, is the major significant predictor of entrepreneurship development in the manufacturing SME sector, followed by internet availability, technology innovation and cyber security in that order as shown in the standardized Beta and the corresponding P-values.

Effect of ATM services on entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs

The null hypothesis states that ATM services have no significant effect on the entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State. Pearson's correlation

coefficient was used to ascertain the relationship between ATM services and entrepreneurship development, while multiple regressions analysis was employed to establish the contribution of ATM services to entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs. Table 5 illustrates the correlation coefficient between these variables.

Table 5 reveals the correlation coefficient between ATM services and entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs ($r=0.611$, $p<0.05$). Results show that ATM services are positively and significantly correlated with the dependent variable (entrepreneurship development). The p-value is lower than 0.05, and the correlation coefficient is 0.611 or 61.1%. With this level of significance, the null hypothesis was rejected. There is a positive and significant relationship between ATM services and entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs. Tests were conducted using multiple regressions analysis to ascertain the contribution of each element of ATM services on the entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State of Nigeria.

Table 5 PEARSON'S CORRELATION BETWEEN AUTOTELLER MACHINES (ATM) AND ENTREPRENEURSHIP DEVELOPMENT			
Variables		Autoteller Machines (ATM)	Entrepreneurship development
Autoteller Machines (ATM)	Pearson's Correlation	1	611**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.002
	N	344	344
Entrepreneurship development	Pearson's Correlation	611**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.002	
	N	344	344

Note: **Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Table 6 MODEL SUMMARY OF REGRESSION				
Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	0.062 ^a	0.557	0.487	5.00447

Note: a. Predictors: (Constant), onsite ATM, offsite ATM, bio-metric ATM.

Table 6 above shows the regression coefficient (R) at 0.62 or 62%. This implies that there is relationship exists between the dependent and independent variables. The coefficient of determination represented by (R^2) with a value of 0.557 or 55.7% shows the level of variation in the dependent variable. In this case, 55.7% of the variability of entrepreneurship development in the manufacturing SME sector in Anambra State was jointly accounted for by the predictor variables of onsite ATM, offsite ATM, and bio-metric ATM.

Table 7 SUMMARY OF ANALYSIS OF VARIANCE (ANOVA)						
	Model	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	2.252	3	2.252	24.573	0.001 ^b
	Residual	839.495	294	9.027		
	Total	841.747	297			

Note: a. Dependent Variable: Entrepreneurship development

b. Predictors: (Constant), Onsite ATM, offsite ATM, bio-metric ATM.

Table 8 SUMMARY OF REGRESSION COEFFICIENTS, t-VALUE AND PROBABILITY LEVEL					
Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
	B	Std. Error	Beta		
1 (Constant)	0.673	0.371		2.882	0.001
Onsite ATM	0.164	0.105	0.115	1.189	0.000
Offsite ATM	0.138	0.092	0.072	1.323	0.002
Bio-metric ATM	0.291	0.158	0.198	2.570	0.000

Note: a. Dependent: Entrepreneurship development

Table 7 above revealed that the F value is at 24.573, and the sig level is at 0.001, which is lesser than 0.05. This implies that the model is significant and good for prediction.

The regression model also reveals the contribution of each of the ATM services (onsite ATM, offsite ATM, bio-metric ATM) in predicting the entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra state. The result in Table 8 shows that bio-metric ATM is the most significant predictor of entrepreneurship development, followed by onsite ATM and offsite ATM in that order, as shown in the standardized Beta and the corresponding P-values.

Effect of Crowd funding Services on Entrepreneurship Development of Manufacturing SMEs

The null hypothesis asserts that crowdfunding services have no significant effect on the entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State. To examine the relationship between crowdfunding services and entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State, this study used Pearson's correlation coefficient and multiple regressions analysis. The Pearson's correlation coefficient was used to ascertain the relationship between crowdfunding services and entrepreneurship development. Multiple regressions analysis was utilized to determine the contribution of crowdfunding services to the entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs. Therefore, Table 9 illustrates the correlation coefficient between these variables.

Table 9 PEARSON'S CORRELATION BETWEEN CROWDFUNDING AND ENTREPRENEURSHIP DEVELOPMENT			
Variables		Crowdfunding	Entrepreneurship development
Crowdfunding	Pearson's Correlation	1	0.626**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		0.000
	N	344	344
Entrepreneurship development	Pearson's Correlation	0.626**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	0.000	
	N	344	344

Note: **. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Table 9 reveals the correlation coefficient between crowdfunding services and entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs ($r=0.626$, $p<0.05$). The correlation coefficient table shows that crowdfunding services positively and significantly correlate with the dependent variable (entrepreneurship development). The p-value is lower than 0.05 and the correlation coefficient is 0.627 or 62.7%. With this level of significance, the null hypothesis was

rejected, and this means that there is a positive and significant relationship between crowdfunding services and entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State, Nigeria. However, the relationship between the two variables is not only significant but equally strong and positive.

Table 10 MODEL SUMMARY OF REGRESSION				
Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	0.518 ^a	0.501	0.482	5.00680

Note: a. Predictors: (Constant), identifying opportunities for entrepreneurial funding; Quality of project ideas; interactions with funders; building of personal networks and social capital; managing project and accountability to funders.

The regression results exhibited in Table 10 show that the regression coefficient (R) has a value of 0.518, meaning that a 51.8% relationship exists between the dependent and independent variables. Similarly, the coefficient of determination (R²) with a value of 0.501 shows that the predictors can explain 50.1% variation in the dependent variable.

Table 11 SUMMARY OF ANALYSIS OF VARIANCE (ANOVA)					
Model	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1 Regression	.950	1	0.950	21.105	0.000 ^b
Residual	840.798	259	9.041		
Total	841.747	260			

a. Dependent Variable: Entrepreneurship development

b. Predictors: (Constant), identifying opportunities for entrepreneurial funding; Quality of project ideas; interactions with funders; building of personal networks and social capital; managing project and accountability to funders

Table 11 reveals that F-statistics is 21.105, and it is statistically significant because 0.05 is greater than 0.000. Therefore, the model is significant and valid for predictions.

Table 12 SUMMARY OF REGRESSION COEFFICIENTS, T-VALUE AND PROBABILITY LEVEL					
Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
	B	Std. Error	Beta		
1 (Constant)	1.932	0.582		5.862	0.000
Identifying opportunities	0.481	0.375	0.324	3.489	0.000
Quality of project ideas	0.196	0.045	0.149	1.219	0.004
Interactions with funders	0.135	0.085	0.105	1.532	0.057
Building of personal networks and social capital	343	0.121	0.301	3.589	0.002
Managing project	0.172	0.086	0.137	1.863	0.001
Accountability to funders	0.223	0.028	0.279	2.321	0.000

Note: a. Dependent Variable: Entrepreneurship development

The regression model also reveals the contribution of each aspect of the crowdfunding services in the prediction of entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State, Nigeria. The result in Table 12 shows that identifying opportunities which is one of the crowdfunding services, is the major significant predictor of entrepreneurship development of

manufacturing SMEs, followed by the building of personal networks and social capital, accountability to funders, quality of project ideas, and managing project in that order as shown in the standardized Beta and the corresponding P-values. However, interactions with funders are insignificant to the entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra State.

DISCUSSION

The study reveals that the three channels for a cashless economy, namely internet banking services, ATM and crowdfunding, are pivotal in entrepreneurship in the manufacturing SME sector in Nigeria. First, this study found that internet banking services had a significant positive effect on entrepreneurship development. Excellent and robust entrepreneurship development in Nigeria is likely to occur with high-quality customer service, good internet facilities, technology innovation and cyber security. Adeyemi et al. (2014) found that internet banking significantly predicts customer satisfaction. Onyekwelu & Nnabugwu (2018) concluded that internet/online banking services have a positive and significant effect on the performance of MSMEs in Anambra State. In this way, it is clear that internet banking is critical for business performance and influences customer satisfaction. It is equally essential to illuminate that the result of this study is equally consistent with that of Okeke (2017), who specifically highlighted that internet mobile banking services have a positive and significant effect on the development of SMEs in Anambra State. The convenience of mobile and internet banking services positively affects the performance of SMEs (Simon & Thomas, 2016). This study is insightful as it has related internet banking specifically to entrepreneurship development which is different from previous studies which focused on the relationship of internet banking with customers' satisfaction, SMEs development and performance.

Second, the study has revealed that ATM services (onsite ATM, offsite ATM, bio-metric ATM) are significant predictors of entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra state. The study is explicit that ATM services have significant positive effects on the entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Anambra state of Nigeria. Proper use of ATMs by customers has contributed to the sustainable cashless economy adopted by Nigeria. In other words, if the adoption of ATM variables like onsite ATM, offsite ATM, bio-metric ATM is given low considerations by marketing in banks, the entrepreneurship development of manufacturing SMEs in Nigeria will be negatively affected.

The majority of the owner-managers support the adoption of cashless policies propagated by the Federal Government of Nigeria. The continued and efficient use of ATMs limits the excess flow of cash in the economy, promoting creativity and innovation and reducing risks in the business environments. More importantly, financial institutions consider bio-metric ATMs ideal to securely service illiterate people as they use fingerprints to access a bank account. The result of this study corroborates with Onyekwelu & Nnabugwu (2018), who concluded that the use of ATM services has a positive and significant effect on the performance of MSMEs. Furthermore, a study by Ali & Emenike (2016) added that the use of ATM services positively and significantly enhanced the transactions of the MSMEs in Nigeria. Despite the variety of benefits for entrepreneurs when using ATMs, the dominant concern is the alarming rate of ATM fraud.

Third, it was found that crowdfunding has a significant effect on entrepreneurship development in Anambra State of Nigeria. More specifically, activities of identifying

opportunities for entrepreneurial funding; quality of project ideas, interactions with funders, building personal networks and social capital; managing project and accountability to funders are significant predictors of entrepreneurship development in Anambra State of Nigeria. It is key to underscore that Nigerian entrepreneurs are identifying opportunities for entrepreneurial funding, the pursuit of quality of project ideas using both social capital and technology-enabled platforms, which considers accountability to funders. As part of developing entrepreneurship in the digital era, entrepreneurs need to be aware that crowdsourcing is a model of sourcing that may help them source not just funds, but also innovative ideas from a large, relatively open and rapidly evolving group of online participants. However, it is essential to highlight that entrepreneurs are not interested in interacting with a funder who expects huge returns, which deter entrepreneurship development. Based on the foregoing, the study concludes that channels for a cashless economy, namely, internet banking, ATM and crowdfunding have a significant effect on entrepreneurship development according to owner-managers of manufacturing SMEs in Nigeria. It is paramount that a deliberate effort is made by government and non-governmental agencies engaged in developing entrepreneurship among SMEs to unpack the value and benefits of these payment channels for customer satisfaction, business performance and survival. Banks need to leverage digitalization and innovation to enhance payment systems for a cashless economy as a key contributor to entrepreneurship development in Nigeria and other developing countries.

CONCLUSION

The study has three significant implications for financial service providers, mobile service providers and business development practitioners. First, SME development agencies need to encourage SMEs to use crowdfunding to raise funds for their business, ATM and Internet banking services to increase the satisfaction of their customers and performance of SMEs. In this regard, mobile service providers in conjunction with banks should develop friendlier, secure and easier to use and efficient applications for SMEs to make payments anywhere and anytime.

Second, banks should invest in ATMs that are easy to use and guarantee privacy, are affordable and allow customers to make deposits. Lastly, an integrated marketing effort of the channels for a cashless economy is needed in Nigeria. Such a collaborative marketing effort must be led by banking institutions, the chamber of commerce, and institutions involved in SME development. It is fundamental to underscore that the campaign may be less valuable if the channels for the cashless economy are not user friendly, lack reliability and are perceived as insecure by owner-managers of SMEs. As this study focused on owner-managers in the manufacturing sector only, there is a need for future research to get insights from a more diverse sample that includes owner-managers from different sectors. Furthermore, future researchers also need to explore the effect of these three channels for the cashless economy at various stages of the enterprise (e.g. early stage, growth, mature) to develop a more nuanced understanding of the effect of channels for the cashless economy on the development of entrepreneurship, especially in developing countries.

REFERENCES

- Adeyemi, O.A., Ola, O.S., & Oyewole, F.A. (2014). Internet banking functionality in Nigeria and outcomes of customer satisfaction: an empirical investigation. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 4(8), 195-204.
- Agwu, E., & Agumadu, M. (2016). Analysis of the emergent issues in internet banking adoption in Nigeria. *European Journal of Social Science*, 52(2), 162-174.
- Ajagbe, M.A., & Ismail, K. (2014). Factors influencing venture capital assessment of high growth companies in Malaysia. *International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Small Business*, 21(4), 457-494.
- Akanwa, P.U., & Akpanabia, N.H. (2012). *Entrepreneurship development as panacea for unemployment reduction in Nigeria*.
- Ali, P.I., & Kalu, E.O. (2016). Impact of automated teller machine on banking services delivery in Nigeria: a stakeholder analysis. *Cadernos de Educação, Tecnologia e Sociedade*, 9(1), 64-72.
- Aremu, Y.S., Olusoga, A.L., & Egbekule, S.O. (2015). CBN cashless policy: Does it financially include micro-entrepreneurs in informal sector? Empirical verity from Ogun-State, Nigeria. *American Journal of Economics*, 5(6), 595-608
- Böckel, A., Hörisch, J., & Tenner, I. (2021). A systematic literature review of crowdfunding and sustainability: highlighting what really matters. *Management Review Quarterly*, 71, 433-453.
- Eckhardt, J.T., & Shane, S.A. (2003). Opportunities and entrepreneurship. *Journal of Management*, 29(3), 333-349.
- Elechi, A.C., & Rufus, A. (2016). Cashless policy in Nigeria and its socio-economic impacts. *Public Policy and Administration Research*, 6(10), 16-22.
- Igbara, F.N., Emerenini, F.M., & Daasi, G.L. (2015). The impact of cashless policy on small scale businesses in Ogoni land of rivers state, Nigeria. *OSR Journal of Economics and Finance*, 6(3), 33-38.
- Jovanović, T. (2019). Crowdfunding: what do we know so far?. *International Journal of Innovation and Technology Management*, 16(01), 1950009.
- Kombe, S.K., & Wafula, M.K. (2015). Effects of internet banking on the financial performance of commercial banks in Kenya a case of Kenya Commercial Bank. *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications*, 5(5), 1-10.
- Kumar, J., & Bansal, G. (2019). Cashless economy- literature review and relevant facts. *ELK Asia Pacific Journal of Finance and Risk Management*, 10(2), 1-29.
- Mollick, E. (2014). The dynamics of crowdfunding: An exploratory study. *Journal of Business Venturing*, 29(1), 1-16.
- Mpho, B. (2017). Returns of the cashless economy in Nigeria. *International Journal for Management and Applied Science*, 3(9), 10-14.
- Nwani, J.J., Nwaimo, C.E., Kanu, S.I & Chinonso, K.I. (2020). Cashless policy and the Nigerian payment system. *International Journal of Innovation and Economic Development*, 5(6), 7-29.
- Nwankwo, C.A., & Ifejiolor, A.P. (2018). Social media: A critical examination of its effect on students 'shopping habits. *European Journal of Education Studies*.
- Nwankwo, C.A., & Kanyangale, M. (2020). **Deconstructing entrepreneurial marketing dimensions in small and medium-sized enterprises in Nigeria: A literature analysis**. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Venturing*, 12(3), 321-341.
- Nwankwo, C.A., Kanyangale, M., & Abugu, J.O. (2019). Online shopping industry and its consumers in Nigeria. *Journal of Economics, Management and Trade*, 1-12.
- Ochiabuto, E. (2016). Cashless economy and the Nigerian experience. *Research Journal of Finance and Accounting*.
- Ohiani, A.S. (2020). Technology innovation in the Nigerian banking system: prospects and challenges. *Rajagiri Management Journal*, 15(1), 2-15.
- Okeke, C., & Nwankwo, F. (2017). Rural entrepreneurship and rural development in Nigeria. *Africa's Public Service Delivery and Performance Review*, 5(1), 1-7.
- Okeke, M.N. (2017). Effect of cashless economy on development small and medium scale enterprises in Anambra State. *International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities Reviews*, 7(2), 113-126.
- Okereke, J.U. (2016). Cashless banking transactions and economic growth of Nigeria. *Middle-East Journal of Scientific Research*, 24(11), 3576-3581.

- Omotayo, F., & Dahunsi, O. (2015). Factors affecting adoption of point of sale terminals by business organizations in Nigeria. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 5(10), 115-136.
- Onyekwelu, N.P., & Nnabugwu, O.C (2018). Effect of cashless economy on the performance of micro, small and medium scale enterprises in Anambra State, Nigeria. *International Journal of Science and Research*, 9(5), 375-385.
- Petruzzelli, A.M., Natalicchio, A., Panniello, U., & Roma, P. (2019). Understanding the crowdfunding phenomenon and its implications for sustainability. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 141, 138-148.
- Reistad, D.L. (1967). The coming cashless society. *Business Horizons*, 10(3), 23-32.
- Schumpeter, J.A. (1934). The theory of economic development: An inquiry into profits, capital, credit, interest and the business cycle. *Journal of Comparative Research in Anthropology and Sociology*, 3(02), 137-148.
- Simon, V.T., Thomas, A.S.R., & Senaji, R. (2016). Effect of electronic banking on customer satisfaction in selected commercial banks, Kenya. *International Academic Journal of Human Resource and Business Administration*, 2(2), 41-63.
- Soyibo, A. (2016). The concept of entrepreneurship. *Journal of Business Organization and Development*, 1(5), 13-22.
- Taiwo, J.N., Oluwafemi, A.K., Afieroho, E.O., & Agwu, M.E. (2016). [Appraisal of cashless policy on the Nigerian financial system](#). *West African Journal of Industrial and Academic Research*, 16(1).