

# IDENTIFYING THE GAPS IN ENTREPRENEURIAL MARKETING CURRICULUM

Mohammed Emad Al-Shaikh, College of Business Administration, Imam Abdulrahman Bin Faisal University, Saudi Arabia

## ABSTRACT

**Purpose:** *This paper aims to share the experiences of developing an Entrepreneurial Marketing curriculum at a leading business school in the Middle East.*

**Methodology:** *A sample of 12 universities/business schools offering Entrepreneurial Marketing courses was selected for this study using the judgmental sampling technique. The entire procedure was based on the notion of "adoption" to "adaptation" originated by the benchmarking approach using a comparative account of 12 business schools offering EM courses. In addition, validity was ensured through a panel of five faculty members from different business schools, teaching entrepreneurship courses, and two entrepreneurs voluntarily associated with business incubators as mentors.*

**Analyses:** *Analyses were made based on the five dimensions of EM curriculum, including course learning outcomes, course syllabus, course textbooks & readings, and course assessment. CLOs were classified into four broad areas: the entrepreneurial context of marketing, entrepreneurial opportunity search, entrepreneurial opportunity evaluation, and entrepreneurial success achievement. This research also provides a detailed comparative account of benchmarking summaries for 12 universities offering entrepreneurial marketing courses, including course learning outcomes, course syllabus, course textbooks & readings, and course assessment.*

**Results:** *Several gaps were identified, including overlapping CLOs between entrepreneurship courses and EM courses; lack of orientation towards Bloom's Taxonomy among EM CLOs. Similarly, the course syllabus overlaps between entrepreneurship courses and EM courses, lack of orientation towards entrepreneurial ecosystem; lack of internationalization; lack of technology and skills development, and lack of integration with internships and practical issues. Finally, 'Marketing Plans' has been given a less significant portion in assessments.*

**Recommendations:** *This research paper presents the findings on various methodological issues of curriculum design, i.e., course structure, textbooks, and assessment methods (assignments, quizzes, projects). It also provides numerous recommendations to academicians, including standardizing the course learning outcomes, updating the curriculum, including the entrepreneurial ecosystem, internationalize the curriculum, emphasizing skill development, and enriching with technology topics, focusing on the curriculum core issues, shift assessments from exam-based to action-based. Finally, it also provides sample CLOs, course contents, sample case studies as part of recommendations.*

**Limitations:** *Two limitations were identified in this research. Firstly, limited availability of literature on Entrepreneurial Marketing curriculum or education. Secondly, this research is based on secondary sources and validated by a jury of experts.*

**Implications:** *The principal target audience for this paper are deans, vice deans, heads of departments mainly responsible for developing and launching new courses. This paper provides a systematic mechanism for designing a new curriculum. This paper also provides*

*significant help to faculty members teaching entrepreneurial marketing curriculum. Finally, it provides baseline data for future research.*

**Keywords:** Entrepreneurial Marketing, Curriculum Designing, Education, Startup Marketing, Marketing, Entrepreneurship.

## INTRODUCTION

The concept of entrepreneurship education has been conceived and developed at top business schools. Following the trend, many business schools globally have started providing entrepreneurship education. However, due to the emergence of new approaches for teaching entrepreneurship, the existing entrepreneurship education programs are not equipped with the necessary skills to meet the practical needs of the graduates. One of the key skill-sets that most entrepreneurs and startups are lacking is entrepreneurial marketing (EM).

The strength of successful entrepreneurs is always seen as the use of effective and efficient marketing tools. This requires greater reliance on EM tactics than corporate marketing tools, including expansive advertising and branding campaigns. However, an assessment of 220 entrepreneurship undergraduate programs shows EM and digital marketing having a relatively smaller proportion in the undergraduate entrepreneurship curriculum portfolio (Siddiqui & Alaraifi, 2019).

Traditional marketing has failed to attract entrepreneurs, start-ups, and SMEs. Similarly, marketing graduates do not wish to join startups with limited marketing budgets and channels. That makes both parties less than optimum and least attractive employers and employees (Cheng et al., 2016; Copley, 2013; ). In essence, they have suggested a need to update the existing EM curriculum to reflect the need for innovation and unique characteristics of startups and entrepreneurs. This is valid for both entrepreneurship programs and business programs offering EM as a course.

The purpose of this paper is to share the experiences of developing an Entrepreneurial Marketing (EM) curriculum at a leading business school in the Middle East. In addition, it aims to identify gaps in the existing literature on EM curriculum and EM course offerings by the academic institutions. In the end, it provides recommendations to fill the gaps in the EM curriculum.

## LITERATURE REVIEW

Entrepreneurial Marketing (EM) is a specialized topic, and relevant literature is thin. For the last four decades, only a few publications emerged in this category. On the other hand, only five publications were found on EM focused on '*Education*' or '*Curriculum*' (Jones & Hegarty, 2011; Stokes & Wilson, 2010; Peltier & Scovotti, 2010; Amjad et al., 2020; Gilmore et al., 2020; Kannampuzha & Suoranta, 2016)

The literature has argued that entrepreneurship marketing can be utilized in various ways to promote entrepreneurship in education. Extensive research conducted in the fields of marketing and entrepreneurship can be utilized to evaluate the educational value of these subjects (Jones & Hegarty, 2011; Abou-Warda, 2015; Al-Shaikh & Siddiqui, 2021).

Another study has investigated the feasibility of expanding entrepreneurship education in a marketing organization. Key questions aim to get students thinking about what it means to be entrepreneurs and what they would like to know when pursuing it. An international marketing

association to collect entrepreneurial marketing mindset and activities among college students conducted the study. This study revealed that a large segment of marketing undergraduates desire to become entrepreneurs. They are highly focused on developing their skills and knowledge in various entrepreneurship-related activities and tools. The study on entrepreneurial marketing has been neglected in the literature. This study is the first to study the needs of students in an international marketing organization (Peltier & Scovotti, 2010; Petrylaite, 2018)

A conceptual paper has highlighted the three dimensions of entrepreneurship education entrepreneurship educators use to help them develop effective teaching strategies. Instead of conforming to the traditional notions of marketing, they tend to adopt a more challenging approach. The conceptual road, which is less traveled, presents a different perspective on entrepreneurship and its various forms. It challenges our understanding of the phenomenon and its various forms (Stokes & Wilson, 2010)

Another recent publication highlighted entrepreneurial marketing as the most critical skill that SMEs needs, and the lack of EM skill-set is one of the main factors that lead to the failure of businesses. The failure of SMEs to develop entrepreneurship undermines the efforts of governments and private institutions in supporting the growth of SMEs. This paper argues that the lack of adequate education for aspiring entrepreneurs undermines the educational reforms being implemented in the region (Amjad et al., 2020). Another point raised by the author is the approach towards EM teaching. The current business school's approach to teaching and learning is unsuitable for graduates' practical entrepreneurship needs, resulting in a massive pool of potential entrepreneurs and eventually generates a need to review the EM curriculum at the micro-level.

Earlier studies have linked EM with experiential learning and suggest four experiential dimensions affect member satisfaction and professional development-strategic and tactical activities, interpersonal and networking skills, entrepreneurial and venture experience, and applied to learn through contacts with professionals (Peltier et al., 2008).

More recently, one such study provides an overview of the various types of education related to entrepreneurship marketing and their various components. It also addresses the various factors that influence the design and delivery of such programs. For example, many industries have adopted EM processes and activities to improve their operations. This has affected the education of EM students. A review of relevant literature identified four key questions that were posed to university educators when it comes to teaching EM, and these questions are; (1) what should be taught; (2) how it should be taught; (3) where it should be taught; and (4) who should teach EM (Gilmore et al., 2020). This research serves as a macro-level decision-making tool, but it does not address the EM curriculum's micro-level or classroom-level discussion.

Since EM has evolved a lot during the last decade, academic literature has also directed the need for curriculum updating exercises from time to time. The purpose of this paper is to highlight the need to review the EM curriculum and provide recommendations to EM academics. Accordingly, the study's central question is to identify the gaps in the EM curriculum at university levels. Form this central question, and the following sub-questions are presented: 1. What are course-learning outcomes to be added to the EM curriculum at tertiary levels? 2. What must be taught as course content in higher education? 3. What textbooks and reading material must be recommended? What assessment methods must be used?

Earlier studies provide several suggestions to increase the effectiveness of entrepreneurial education is worth mentioning here. For instance, university-level entrepreneurship education should include an internship component (Botha & Bignotti, 2016). In addition, experiential

learning as a teaching strategy improve entrepreneurship education (Tete et al., 2014), especially EM education (Tetê et al., 2012).

Business schools are the sole provider of formal education on EM. In addition, business incubators and accelerator programs (Siddiqui et al., 2021) typically provide informal education on EM or even angel investors, and venture capitalists also provide EM tactics and tips after selecting startups to invest in (Siddiqui et al., 2021). Therefore, business schools must update and upgrade the EM curriculum regularly.

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

The objective of the current study was to identify the gaps in EM Curriculum and recommend appropriate solutions. This research uses a two-staged method of studying entrepreneurial marketing education, employing (a) taking a sample of a reasonable number of universities offering EM education, (b) validating the results with the help of a significant number of experts. This method has been used in earlier studies (Botha & Bignotti, 2016). A sample of EM courses was selected for this study using the judgmental sampling technique. Two primary criteria were applied for selecting the sample. Firstly, EM courses must be offered by a recognized university listed in the QS ranking as an undergraduate course. Secondly, all curriculum structures, course specifications, and other material were available online. Although there was no specific quota for any country or region, all efforts were made to include all universities offering EM courses at the undergraduate level in the sample. Finally, a list of 12 institutions offering at least three credit hours courses on EM was finalized. Table 1 shows the list of universities offering Entrepreneurial Marketing as a course at the undergraduate level.

<b>University</b>	<b>Country</b>
University of Technology, Sydney(UTS )	Australia
Thompson River University (TRU)	Canada
National University of Singapore (NUS)	Singapore
American Public University (APU)	US
California State University (CSU)	US
Loyla University (LU)	US
University of Washington (UW)	US
Texas A&M University (TAMU)	US
Western Michigan University (WMU)	US
Yale University (YU)	US
Cardiff University (CU)	UK
University of London (UL)	UK

All information for related courses and programs was downloaded from the official websites of the universities. In the second phase, all information was organized in benchmarking tables, including Course Learning Outcomes, course contents, textbooks, and course assessments. In the subsequent phase, validity was ensured through a panel of five faculty members from different business schools, teaching entrepreneurship courses at different levels, i.e., undergraduate, MBA, and executive education. In addition, two respondents are experienced entrepreneurs affiliated with local business incubators as mentors. All invited respondents were graduates of leading business schools in Europe, Asia, and the USA. Table 2 shows the tabular presentation of respondent's demographic data.

Variables	Respondent's Data						
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Age	25-35	25-35	45-55	35-45	35-45	35-45	35-45
Gender	M	F	M	M	M	M	M
Education	Master	Master	PhD	PhD	PhD	PhD	PhD
Experience	10-15	1- 5	20 -25	10-15	10-15	10-15	5 -10
Profession	Entrepreneurs		Teaching/Business School Faculty				
Relevant Subjects	Mentor at Business Incubators		Entrepreneurship, Entrepreneurial Marketing, Entrepreneurial Finance, Innovation & Creativity, Techno-Entrepreneurship				

The validation session was started with a presentation by the host stating the objective of the research, pointers from literature review, problems in entrepreneurial marketing curriculum, and identification of gaps in the curriculum at higher education. Finally, they were asked to validate the benchmarking tables identified earlier. All tables were validated with suggestions for minor changes. One of the suggestions was to incorporate Bloom's taxonomy on course learning outcomes and assessments methods. Annexure A, B, C, and D present the revised benchmarking summaries. A follow-up meeting was held to discuss the changes suggested by the respondents and validate the gaps identified and recommendations for this research. Table 3 shows the results of the validation exercise; all sections were validated.

Section	Validity Check						
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
EM Course Learning Outcomes	√	√	√	√			√
EM Course Syllabus	√	√	√	√	√	√	
EM Course Textbooks & Readings	√	√		√	√	√	√
EM Course Assessment	√	√	√	√	√	√	√

## ANALYSES

Annexure A shows benchmarking summary for EM CLOs. It ranges from three to eleven CLOs for each course. Analysis shows that the difference between a complete course on entrepreneurship and EM is still blurring. Some courses have CLOs, which are more suitable for entrepreneurship courses but not for EM courses. For example, *'Develop a sound financial plan and be aware of the sources of financing in business.'* A better objective could be *'Develop a budget for Entrepreneurial Marketing Plan.'* Ironically contemporary CLOs like *'Integration with digital marketing'* or *'Taking leverage from entrepreneurial ecosystem'* were almost absent in all course outlines studied. CLOs were classified into four broad areas based on logical milestones and relevant course contents (Table 4).

CLO Areas	Relevant Course Contents
Entrepreneurial context of marketing.	Marketing in an Entrepreneurial Context
Entrepreneurial Opportunity Search	Marketing Research, Understanding Customers and Competitors
Entrepreneurial Opportunity Evaluation	Segmentation, Targeting, Positioning, Developing New Products/Services, Branding; Pricing; Channel Development; Promotion
Entrepreneurial Success Achievement	Entrepreneurial Marketing Plans.

Annexure – B shows benchmarking summary for the EM course syllabus. Analysis shows that some courses have course contents, which are more suitable for entrepreneurship courses but not for EM courses. For example, *'Evaluation of new business ideas through feasibility analysis'* or *'Develop a sound financial plan and be aware of the sources of financing in business'* or *'Write and present effective business plans.'* The most extensive critique on this issue is that feasibility studies or business plans are completed much earlier than entrepreneurial marketing.

Annexure – C shows benchmarking summary for EM course textbooks and readings. Most textbooks and reading material were more than five years old, and some faculty members have recommended 20-year-old textbooks. In addition, after skimming through the syllabus of EM from different business schools, case studies recommended in the course outlines are also out of date. For example, the MarketSoft case study published by Harvard Business School in 1990 and revised in 2006 is incompatible with the current technology and market situation.

Annexure – D shows benchmarking summary for EM course assessment. The Marketing Plan has emerged as the only consistent component of assessment tools used EM curriculum. Most of the course outlines assess Marketing Plan as a group project assignment, while some assess it as an assignment or some have integrated with the simulation software. Another significant weightage is given to written exams, both mid and end-term exams.

## RESULTS

EM education has a significant role in the professional development of Entrepreneurs and even more in improving their professional skills. Summary points noted from the literature review were analyzed in light of aggregate major subject areas highlighted by the subject area analysis of the universities offering postgraduate EM courses. Several gaps were identified.

Firstly, there is an overlapping of CLOs between the Entrepreneurship course and EM course. CLOs suitable for entrepreneurship courses may not be suitable for EM courses as entrepreneurship courses have a much broader scope than EM courses. Another significant gap identified was the lack of orientation towards Bloom's Taxonomy among EM CLOs. Finally, there should be a distinction between higher-order learning needs and lower-order learning needs.

Secondly, this overlapping issue continues to the syllabus as well. As mentioned above, some course contents may not be suitable for EM courses as entrepreneurship courses have a much broader scope than EM courses. Moreover, EM courses are considered static while the nature of EM itself is very dynamic. Therefore, most of the course contents in EM courses are old and need revision.

Thirdly, the biggest disappointment of the EM curriculum is that EM has been taught as standalone. As a result, most of the course outlines do not offer students to learn how to take advantage of the entrepreneurial ecosystem, especially business incubators and accelerators (Siddiqui et al., 2021) or even pitch the entrepreneurial idea in front of angel investors or venture capitalist (Siddiqui et al., 2021).

Fourth, throughout the world, EM practices are becoming international even business incubators in their fourth generation, making themselves internationalize organizations with cross-border collaborations. Nevertheless, this has not been reflected in the EM syllabus. Instead, it is still taught in a static local context.

Fifth, EM competencies and EM skill development have dramatically affected the EM sphere (Ardley et al., 2020) and technology adoptions, but these critical components of EM are not reflected in the EM curriculum.

Sixth, the literature suggests that university-level entrepreneurship education should include an internship component (Botha & Bignotti, 2016). EM is a practical topic, but a survey of EM courses has not discussed integrating internships into the EM curriculum. This would help identify and share best practices in the field.

Finally, literature has argued that experiential learning as a teaching strategy improve entrepreneurship education (Tete et al., 2014), especially EM education (Tetê et al., 2012). 'Marketing Plans' are classified as the best possible experiential learning exercise for the EM curriculum. It has been included in 'Metacognitive Knowledge' under Bloom's Taxonomy. High order learning needs should be given a significant portion in assessments. It is evident from analyses that significant weightage is given to written exams, both mid and end-term exams.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the literature review, benchmarking report of the sampled Masters in EM courses, and suggestions from EM experts following recommendations put forward.

**Standardize the Course Learning Outcomes:** One of the gaps identified in this paper is the overlapping of CLOs between the entrepreneurship course and the EM courses. This overlapping starts from CLOs. Therefore, it is recommended to standardize the CLOs and include at least four major CLO areas in any EM curriculum. Table 5 present a sample list of CLOs for an EM course.

<b>Bloom's Taxonomy</b>	<b>CLO Areas</b>	<b>Course Learning Outcomes</b>
Factual Knowledge	Entrepreneurial context of marketing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Understand basic marketing concepts in entrepreneurial settings</li> <li>• Distinguish between traditional and entrepreneurial marketing paradigms.</li> </ul>
Conceptual Knowledge	Entrepreneurial Opportunity Search	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Use marketing research to explore entrepreneurial opportunities.</li> <li>• Use marketing research to understand customer's needs, wants, and desires.</li> <li>• Use marketing intelligence to understand competitors and market dynamics.</li> </ul>
Procedural Knowledge	Entrepreneurial Opportunity Evaluation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Apply market segmentation, determine target market, and position the product.</li> <li>• Develop innovative products/services.</li> <li>• Apply innovative pricing strategies.</li> <li>• Establish innovative channels of delivery.</li> <li>• Use innovative promotional techniques.</li> </ul>
Metacognitive Knowledge	Entrepreneurial Success Achievement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Develop a marketing plan for an entrepreneurial idea</li> </ul>

**Update the Curriculum:** This paper urges faculty-teaching EM to update their course syllabus and textbooks. It is recommended to keep the most current knowledge as part of the EM curriculum. It is further recommended to consider EM in a dynamic environment, and all efforts must be made to monitor and include the modern trends affecting Entrepreneurial Marketing constantly. It is also recommended to choose new cases from top case repositories for less than

five years old. Table 6 presents sample course contents for Entrepreneurial Marketing course. Table 7 suggests some cases studies be uses in classrooms.

<b>No.</b>	<b>Ideal Course Contents</b>
1	Entrepreneurial Marketing
2	Entrepreneurial market opportunity analysis
3	Entrepreneurial Marketing Strategy
4	Market Research & Understanding Customers
5	Segmentation, Targeting, & Positioning
6	Marketing Mix & Product Management
7	Entrepreneurial branding
8	Entrepreneurial Pricing
9	Entrepreneurial Channel Management
10	Entrepreneurial promotion
11	Digital Marketing
12	Marketing Plans

<b>Title of Case</b>	<b>Author</b>
Market Disruption Strategies: The Transformation of Xiaomi	Yang, Roesse, Chattopadhyay
Airbnb, Etsy, Uber: Expanding from One to Many Millions of Customers	Thales S. Teixeira
Entrepreneurial Marketing: Learning from High-Potential Ventures	Joseph B. Lassiter
Adeo Health Science: Turning a Product into a Brand	Elizabeth, Keenan, Jill Avery
Schiit Audio: Does it Make Sense to Sell on Amazon?	Michael, Stanko, Pollack

**Include Entrepreneurial Ecosystem:** Now it is time to include different components of the entrepreneurial ecosystem into the EM curriculum especially teaching students how to take advantage of different domains of an entrepreneurial ecosystem.

**Internationalize the Curriculum:** Throughout the world, EM practices are becoming international. Therefore, the EM curriculum must be flexible, result-oriented, globally focused, and targeted towards developing entrepreneurs recognized both regionally and internationally.

**Emphasize Skill Development:** Various interpersonal, communication, and leadership are needed to be added to the EM curriculum so that future entrepreneurs can prosper in their professional careers. In addition, computing skills also need to be added to get an advantage at every stage of a startup launch.

**Enrich with Technology Topics:** It is recommended to include current technology topics like Artificial Intelligence, Machine Learning, Data Analytics, and Big Data into the EM curriculum.

**Focus on Core Issues:** It is recommended to draw a difference between entrepreneurship and EM courses. For example, many courses teach topics like '*Crafting the business plan*' or '*Creating a financial plan*' and '*Managing cash flow*.' These topics are best suited for a complete course on Entrepreneurship, not EM. On the other hand, developing marketing plans is an integral part of EM courses, and it must be considered a subset of the business plan.

**Shift Assessments from Exam-based to Action-Based:** The EM course is more applied in nature and less in theories and conceptual frameworks. Therefore, it is recommended to shift the significant weightage of course assessments from exam-based to action-based activities.



More recently, "*Marketing Model Canvas*" has been introduced as an assessment tool for the marketing curriculum (Siddiqui, 2021). It provides a one-page, all-inclusive assessment tool for assessing marketing plans, and faculty teaching EM can include '*Marketing Model Canvas*' as part of their course assessment.

## CONCLUSIONS

During the last decade, many factors have entirely overhauled the EM course. These factors include globalization of businesses, technological advancements, professional advancement, and many more. This has led to many changes in the way entrepreneurs carry out their tasks. First, this urges academicians to regularly monitor and revise course learning outcomes, syllabus, textbooks, and assessment tools. Secondly, EM must be considered an evolving concept and regularly update and upgrade the EM curriculum.

## LIMITATIONS

The limitations of this research study are acknowledged. Firstly, the literature review on the topic is minimal. There is a plethora of literature on entrepreneurial marketing, but entrepreneurial marketing education or curriculum development is minimal. EM is an emerging concept and getting momentum during the last few years, and EM curriculum or EM education is a very specialized area and not growing in research proportionate to the EM research.

Finally, this research is based on secondary data, and benchmarking is based on the information available on the official websites of the universities. More documents could be studied to support the benchmarking exercise. Finally and probably, most importantly, this research lacks a survey of students and entrepreneurs identifying the needs and wants of an EM academic course. Further research on the subject may consider these avenues while planning the research.

## IMPLICATIONS

This paper has implications for several stakeholder groups who might benefit from this research on EM curriculum design. Academics and young entrepreneurs are the two major beneficiary stakeholder groups of this research. Entrepreneurs, especially non-business graduates, are more concerned with applying their knowledge instead of its own sake and using this paper, they can compare their skills and knowledge with this research output and identify their learning requirements for marketing. It also serves as a way for them to improve their managerial skills and knowledge in this field. Therefore, they are expected to take more interest in the study's findings and recommendations.

Academics are more concerned with the quality of their information and the communication of their processed knowledge. Academicians have different distinct roles: generation of new knowledge through research and publications, dissemination of knowledge through learning and teaching activities, and knowledge management by designing and updating curricula. This research provides baseline research for researchers. The topic needs more quantitative data from students, entrepreneurs, and academicians to support this research. Faculty teaching EM courses or any entrepreneurship course may also find it helpful to enhance their course syllabus as this paper provide a template for many curriculum design aspects like Course Learning Outcomes, textbooks, cases studies, course outline. The primary target audience for this

paper are deans, vice deans, heads of departments mainly responsible for developing and launching new courses. This paper provides a systematic mechanism for designing a new curriculum. It provides baseline data that might reduce time-consuming and extended academic exercise spanning over many months. It also highlights a benchmarking of leading universities offering EM courses at the undergraduate level. This benchmarking will also be beneficial for faculty and staff developing course material for other courses. This research might also interest corporate managers. They would use the information gathered from this platform to improve their operations and make them more competitive.

## APPENDIX

Annexure-A													
BENCHMARKING SUMMARY FOR ENTREPRENEURIAL MARKETING COURSE LEARNING OUTCOMES WITH REVISED BLOOM'S TAXONOMY													
Revised Blooms' Taxonomy Category	Course Learning Outcomes	UTSA U	TRUC A	NUSS G	APU US	CSU US	LUU S	TAMU US	UWU S	WMU US	YUU S	CUU K	ULU K
Factual Knowledge	Apply appropriate marketing theories, frameworks, and concepts to entrepreneurial contexts	√											
	Apply basic marketing concepts in entrepreneurial settings						√						
	Develop an understanding of the essence of marketing terminology, concepts, and strategies as they apply to small and new ventures;									√			
	Discuss marketing in an entrepreneurial context.		√										
	Discuss the processes of market identification and market creation in												√

entrepreneurial situations.													
Distinguish between traditional and entrepreneurial marketing paradigms.				√									
Evaluate and criticize existing marketing activities in entrepreneurial practice based on marketing theories and concepts	√												
Students will read, write, and analyze the assigned material in order to become proficient in the interpretation and integration of basic marketing concepts, strategies and ethically balanced practices.							√						
Understand entrepreneurship and the challenges of creating a new business.													√
Understand the core concepts of Entrepreneurship and Marketing			√										
Understand the different market needs of big firms and SMEs and describe how marketing has													√

	changed in the 21st century.												
	Students will understand the analytical selection of important marketing issues and blending decisions related to planning, organizing, funding, implementing, and evaluating the marketing of the small entrepreneurial business, and how to interpret and integrate concepts and strategies associated with entrepreneurial enterprise curriculum and business practices.						√						
	Understand key marketing concepts and their application in the entrepreneurial world and digital marketing									√			
	Understand the terms, concepts, language, and ethical practice frameworks used by successful entrepreneurs and those persons or teams responsible for						√						

	marketing entrepreneurial organizations. Students will demonstrate the knowledge of key marketing research concepts, segmentation, guerrilla marketing, promotions strategy, and ethical decision-making when marketing the entrepreneurial firm, products, or services.												
Conceptual Knowledge	Apply creativity and innovation to generate new business ideas and in marketing			√									
	Apply frameworks towards evaluating digital marketing programs									√			
	Build and sustain entrepreneurial branding.		√										
	Critically assess and apply marketing theories and models to new ventures.												√
	Demonstrate analytical, problem-solving, and decision-making skills.												√
	Demonstrate time												√

management skills.													
Describe the role innovation can play in developing a market strategy and how marketing can guide the development of new products and services.													√
Develop new products and services.		√											
Develop skills in analyzing and solving entrepreneurial marketing problems in business									√				
Devise ways to leverage Web .0 in the business			√										
Evaluate the application of relationship marketing.				√									
Evaluation of new business ideas through feasibility analysis			√										
Examine customers and competitors.		√											
Explain marketing foundations of entrepreneurial business practice	√												
Explain the importance of relationship marketing and social networks, and understand the role played by content													√

	marketing agencies.												
	Gain digital and information literacy skills.												√
	Identification of suitable markets, communities, and partners to which your product offering will provide stakeholder value;											√	
	Learn from the experiences of real-life entrepreneurs						√						
	Marketing tactics with sound ethical business practice			√									
Procedural Knowledge	Prioritize the marketing strategies to meet the goals of your venture.				√								
	Provide "how-to" instructions for entrepreneurial marketing								√				
	Provide a clear view of the challenges and opportunities of marketing for entrepreneurial organizations with ample opportunity to question entrepreneurs on a variety of marketing topics.									√			
	Review entrepreneurial channel		√										

development and supply chain management.													
Review entrepreneurial promotion.		√											
Strategies for market reach and network engagement with early adopters and the wider market, both of which are vital for commercial viability and sustainability in settings of rapid technological change;												√	
Successful implementation of a marketing strategy in an entrepreneurial setting.												√	
Synthesize and use information and knowledge effectively to marketing in the entrepreneurial sector.													√
Use entrepreneurial pricing.		√											
Use marketing research to ensure entrepreneurial success.		√											
Use trends in marketing that can be leveraged by entrepreneurs.				√									
Construct segmentation, targeting, and		√											



positioning strategies.													
Construct the right marketing opportunity.		√											
Design and build an operational marketing strategy for a startup business or new product, making the best use of limited resources to ensure that the firm can establish a viable presence in the market.													√
Design/create effective entrepreneurial marketing strategies that produce sustainable competitive advantages for ventures	√												
Determine your target market and market segmentation.				√									
Develop a marketing budget for your venture.				√									
Students will be able to identify the range of solutions and marketing alternatives that provide the most socially responsible and ethically							√						

	sound outcomes.												
	Students will demonstrate that they are able to communicate their business ideas in a team/individual written project and that they can present those ideas orally					√							
	Students will demonstrate that they are able to forecast sales and find out the break-even period.					√							
	Students will demonstrate the ability to identify valid and important issues applicable to the development and implementation of entrepreneurial marketing business.							√					
Metacognitive Knowledge	Apply critical thinking and analytical skills in evaluating marketing theories, models, and proposed plans.												√
	Conduct a marketing audit and develop a marketing plan		√										
	Construct strategies to overcome												√

challenges encountered in the planning process for new products and businesses.													
Create a marketing plan for your venture.				√									
Demonstrate effective written communication skills for plans, strategies, and outcomes.													√
Design a business model, strategic plan, and marketing plan to incorporate creative				√									
Develop a marketing plan for an entrepreneurial idea							√						
Develop a sound financial plan and be aware of the sources of financing in business				√									
Develop and present a marketing plan for an entrepreneurial venture											√		
Have a solid understanding of the basic marketing model of product, promotion, place, and price and the relationship of these critical								√					

<p>elements in the development and implementation of planning and implementing small entrepreneurial business marketing decisions. Specifically, students will demonstrate the ability to incorporate the marketing planning process for successfully marketing entrepreneurial firms or products.</p>													
<p>Learn to write a basic marketing plan for an existing or proposed entrepreneurial company</p>									√				
<p>Provide hands-on experience developing a complete marketing plan – including conducting some degree of primary research – for actual local entrepreneurship.</p>								√					
<p>Solve the problem of "newness" as you develop the marketing plan</p>						√							
<p>Students will also demonstrate that they can</p>					√								

	design a marketing plan for a new business idea.													
	Students will demonstrate their understanding of marketing strategy in an entrepreneurial context					√								
	Write and present an effective business plan			√										

Annexure-B																
BENCHMARKING SUMMARY FOR ENTREPRENEURIAL MARKETING COURSE SYLLABUS																
Session	Topic	Syllabus	UTS AU	TRU CA	NUS SG	APU US	CSU US	LU US	TAMU US	UW US	WMU US	YU US	CU UK	ULU K		
1	Entrepreneurial Marketing	Marketing				√										
		Marketing environment of a venture					√									
		Marketing for Financing Activities	√													
		Marketing for the Entrepreneur									√					
		Trends in Marketing				√										
		Marketing in an Entrepreneurial Context		√												
		Challenge of Entrepreneurship & Marketing Environment				√										
		Quad Marketing Approach									√					
		Integrated Marketing								√						
		Integration Entrepreneurial Marketing Processes					√									
		Introduction to entrepreneurial marketing														√

		Introduction to marketing in an entrepreneurial Context					√						
		Entrepreneurial Marketing: Consolidate & Codify							√				
		Entrepreneurial Context							√				
2	Entrepreneurial market opportunity analysis	Entrepreneurial market opportunity analysis											√
		Finding & Evaluating Entrepreneurial Opportunities								√			
		Finding & Evaluating the Right Marketing Opportunity		√									
		Finding & Evaluating the Right Marketing Opportunity							√				
		Generating, Screening, & Developing Ideas	√										
		Sustainability for the Entrepreneur								√			
3	Entrepreneurial Marketing Strategy	Consistency in strategic choices					√						
		Entrepreneurial marketing strategies											√
		Growth strategy for New Ventures									√		
		Marketing strategy for Early Stage Ventures									√		
		Prioritizing Marketing strategy				√							
		Conducting a Feasibility Analysis &			√								

		Marketing Mix												
4	Market Research	Understanding customers & Competitors		√										
		Understanding customers & Competitors							√					
		Understanding customers						√						
		Customer & competitor analysis												√
		Customer Discovery: Growth Hacking & App Marketing										√		
		Customer value creation					√							
		Market research: Understanding customers											√	
		Doing customer research							√					
		Using Marketing research to Ensure Entrepreneurial Success		√										
		Using marketing research to ensure entrepreneurial success						√						
		Using Marketing research to Ensure Entrepreneurial Success								√				
5	Segmentation, Targeting, & Positioning	Segmentation, targeting, & positioning					√							
		Defining the Target Market			√									
		Target Market & Market Segmentation				√								
		Positioning							√					
		Segmentation,											√	

		Targeting & Positioning												
		Segmentation, Targeting & Positioning for Entrepreneurs		√										
		Segmentation, Targeting, & Positioning Small Business							√					
		Segmentation/ Positioning/Differential Advantage								√				
		Segmenting & targeting your audiences						√						
6	Marketing Mix & Product Management	Marketing Mix & customer Value Management											√	
		Marketing Mix Management							√					
		Developing New Products & Services		√										
		Developing Products & Services								√				
		Product Management											√	
		New Product Development											√	
		Overview of new Product/service development process						√						
		Entrepreneurial Products & services development												√
7	Entrepreneurial branding	Building Brands	√											
		Building & Sustaining a Brand								√				
		Building & Sustaining Entrepreneurial Brand		√										
		Building & Sustaining the Entrepreneurial							√					





		Sales Premonition for the Entrepreneur									√			
		Franchising & Location & Layout			√									
		Franchising for the Entrepreneur									√			
		BB & Sales			√									
10	Entrepreneurial promotion	Promotion, Advertising, & Viral Marketing	√											
		Entrepreneurial promotion: Doing More with Less								√				
		Entrepreneurial promotion		√										
		Entrepreneurial promotion												√
		Advertising & promotion											√	
		Advertising in the Internet Age							√					
		Customer pull						√						
		Public Relations: the entrepreneur's secret weapon							√					
		Personal Selling for the Entrepreneur									√			
		Leverage Public Relations for startup ventures	√											
11	Digital Marketing	Social & Digital Media for the Entrepreneur									√			
		Traditional Media for the Entrepreneur									√			
		Internet, Social Media & Search Engine Optimization								√				



		Performance evaluation of a venture					√							
		Defining the business model for a venture					√							
		Cognitive flexibility						√						
		Coherence						√						
		Competence & marketing						√						
		Concept testing						√						
		Conviction						√						
		From concept to company							√					
		Lessons from Radical Marketing							√					
		Management of Growth & Budgeting								√				
		Context & Objectives								√				
		Experimenting in the Entrepreneurial Venture										√		

Annexure-C												
BENCHMARKING SUMMARY FOR ENTREPRENEURIAL MARKETING TEXTBOOKS & READINGS												
Syllabus	UTSA U	TRU CA	NUSS G	APU US	CSU US	LUU S	UW US	TAMU US	WMU US	YU US	CUU K	ULU K
Lodish et al., (2015). Marketing that works: how entrepreneurial marketing can add sustainable value to any sized company. Pearson Education.	√					√						
Crane (2012). Marketing for Entrepreneurs: Concepts and applications for new ventures. Sage Publications.		√			√			√	√			
Scarborough (2016). Essentials of			√									

entrepreneurship and small business management. Pearson.												
Neumeier (2006). ZAG: the #1 strategy of high-performance brands. Pearson Education.				√								
Lodish et al., (2002). Entrepreneurial marketing: lessons from Wharton's pioneering MBA course. John Wiley & Sons.						√						
Hill & Rifkin (2000). Radical Marketing: From Harvard to Harley, lessons from ten that broke the rules and made it big. Harper Collins.							√					
Moore (1999). Crossing the Chasm: Marketing and Selling High-Tech Products to Mainstream Customers New York: Harper Perennial.								√				
Marshall (2013). 80/20 Sales and Marketing: The Definitive Guide to Working Less and Making More. Entrepreneur Press.									√			
Sheth & Sisodia (2012). The 4 A's of marketing: Creating value for customers, company, and society.											√	

Routledge.													
Chaston. Entrepreneurial marketing: sustaining growth in all organizations 2nd edition (Palgrave Macmillan, 2016)													√
Crane (2013) Marketing for entrepreneurs: concepts and application for new ventures (2 <sup>nd</sup> Edn).													√
There is no standardized text for this course.					√						√		

<b>Annexure-D</b>													
<b>BENCHMARKING SUMMARY FOR ENTREPRENEURIAL MARKETING COURSE ASSESSMENT</b>													
<b>Assessments</b>	<b>Revised Bloom's Taxonomy Category</b>	<b>UTS AU</b>	<b>TRU CA</b>	<b>NUS SG</b>	<b>APU US</b>	<b>CSU US</b>	<b>LUU S</b>	<b>TAM UUS</b>	<b>UW US</b>	<b>WM UUS</b>	<b>YU US</b>	<b>CU UK</b>	<b>UL UK</b>
Quizzes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Factual Knowledge</li> <li>Conceptual Knowledge</li> </ul>	20%	10%			10%	9%						
Participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Factual Knowledge</li> <li>Conceptual Knowledge</li> </ul>		10%	20%	30%		22%		20%		30%		
Assignments	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Procedural Knowledge</li> <li>Metacognitive Knowledge</li> </ul>				35%	30%	9%	25%	30%	25%	50%		
Marketing Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Procedural Knowledge</li> <li>Metacognitive</li> </ul>	30%	30%	35%	35%	30%	60%	25%	30%	25%	20%	40%	50%

	itive Knowledg e												
Exams	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Factual Knowledge</li> <li>• Conceptual Knowledge</li> <li>• Procedural Knowledge</li> </ul>	50%	50%	45%	*	30%	*	50%	20%	50%	*	60%	50%
Total	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Factual Knowledge</li> <li>• Conceptual Knowledge</li> <li>• Procedural Knowledge</li> <li>• Metacognitive Knowledge</li> </ul>	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%
* No written final exam													

## REFERENCES

- Abou-Warda, S.H. (2015). Entrepreneurial orientation in business schools: A comparative study of higher education systems in Egypt. *International Journal of Educational Management*, 29(2), 192-212.
- Al-Shaikh, M.E., & Siddiqui, K.A., (2021). Crossing the Valley of Death: Lessons for Young Entrepreneurs. *Entrepreneurship and Sustainability Issues*, 9(1).
- Amjad, T., Rani, S.H.B.A., & Sa'atar, S.B. (2020). Entrepreneurship development and pedagogical gaps in entrepreneurial marketing education. *The International Journal of Management Education*, 18(2), 100379.
- Ardley, B., Taylor, N., & Hardwick, J.P. (2020). Developing entrepreneurial marketing competencies. In *Entrepreneurship Marketing* (pp. 400-411). Routledge.
- Botha, M., & Bignotti, A. (2016). Internships enhancing entrepreneurial intent and self-efficacy: Investigating tertiary-level entrepreneurship education programmes. *The Southern African Journal of Entrepreneurship and Small Business Management*, 8(1), 1-15.
- Cheng, R., Lourenço, F., & Resnick, S. (2016). Educating graduates for marketing in SMEs: An update for the traditional marketing curriculum. *Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development*, 23(2), 495-513.
- Copley, P. (2013). The need to deliver higher-order skills in the context of marketing in SMEs. *Industry and Higher Education*, 27(6), 465-476.
- Entrepreneurial Marketing. (2021). American Public University, US.
- Entrepreneurial Marketing. (2021). California State University, US.
- Entrepreneurial Marketing. (2021) Cardiff University, UK.
- Entrepreneurial Marketing (2021). Loyola University, US.
- Entrepreneurial Marketing. (2021). National University of Singapore, Singapore.
- Entrepreneurial Marketing. (2021). Texas A & M University (TAMU), US.
- Entrepreneurial Marketing. (2021) The University of Technology, Sydney, Australia.

- Entrepreneurial Marketing. (2021) The University of Washington, US.
- Entrepreneurial Marketing. (2021). The Western Michigan University, US.
- Entrepreneurial Marketing. (2021) Thompson River University, Canada.
- Entrepreneurial Marketing. (2021). University of London (UL) London, UK.
- Entrepreneurial Marketing. (2021). Yale University, USA.
- Gilmore, A., McAuley, A., Miles, M.P., & Pattinson, H. (2020). Four questions of entrepreneurial marketing education: Perspectives of university educators. *Journal of Business Research*, 113, 189-197.
- Jones, C., & Hegarty, C. (2011). Exploring the role of entrepreneurial marketing in entrepreneurship education. *Journal of Small Business & Entrepreneurship*, 24(1), 125-138.
- Kannampuzha, M.J., & Suoranta, M. (2016). Bricolage in the marketing efforts of a social enterprise. *Journal of Research in Marketing and Entrepreneurship*, 18(2), 176-196.
- Peltier, J.W., & Scovotti, C. (2010). Enhancing entrepreneurial marketing education: The student perspective. *Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development*, 17(4), 514-536.
- Peltier, J.W., Scovotti, C., & Pointer, L. (2008). The role the collegiate American Marketing Association plays in professional and entrepreneurial skill development. *Journal of Marketing Education*, 30(1), 47-56.
- Petrylaite, E. (2018). Application of SME Marketing Model within Higher Education Entrepreneurial Teams. In *European Conference on Innovation and Entrepreneurship*, Academic Conferences International Limited, 1060-XVIII.
- Siddiqui, K., & Alaraifi, A. (2019). What they don't teach at entrepreneurship institutions? An assessment of 220 entrepreneurship undergraduate programs. *Journal of Entrepreneurship Education*, 22(6), 1-16.
- Siddiqui, K.A. (2021). Developing Marketing Model Canvas as an Assessment Tool for Marketing Curriculum. *Universal Journal of Education Research*, 9(6), 1333-1339.
- Siddiqui, K.A., Al-Shaikh, M.E., Bajwa, I.A., & Alenzi, O. (2021). Venture capital challenges in Saudi Arabia. *Entrepreneurship and Sustainability Issues*, 8(3), 291.
- Siddiqui, K.A., Al-Shaikh, M.E., Bajwa, I.A., & Al-Subaie, A. (2021). Identifying critical success factors for university business incubators in Saudi Arabia. *Entrepreneurship and Sustainability Issues*, 8(3), 267.
- Stokes, D., & Wilson, N.C. (2010). Entrepreneurship and marketing education: time for the road less travelled? *International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Innovation Management*, 11(1), 95-108.
- Tetê, M.F., Coelho, R.L.F., de Almeida, M.I.S., & Borges, C. (2012). Experiential Learning as Teaching Strategy for Entrepreneurial Marketing Education: Description of an Experience and Assessment of its Impacts on Students' careers at the Marketing/Entrepreneurship Interface, 80.
- Tete, M.F., Limongi, R., De Almeida, M.I.S., & Borges, C. (2014). Experiential learning as teaching strategy for entrepreneurship: Assessment of a Brazilian experience. *International Journal of Innovation and Learning*, 16(4), 428-447.