

RELATIONS BETWEEN LEGAL CULTURE AND ECONOMIC EMPORWERMENT AMONG MARGINALIZED GROUP OF FARMERS

Endang Sutrisno, Universitas Swadaya Gunung Jati

ABSTRACT

Legal culture is an important component in the process of law enforcement. Legal norms are not in a vacuum but they are strongly influenced by the socio-economic environment. The substance and structure component to streamline the application of norms requires a positive and constructive legal culture. Law No. 7 of 2016 and Regulation of the Minister of Maritime Affairs and Fisheries of the Republic of Indonesia Number 18/PERMEN-KP/2016 contains values of legal progress to provide protection and empowerment to small salt farmers and farmers of salt ponds. The poverty factor in developing countries as well as Indonesia is the cause of the birth of a negative and apathetic legal culture towards the understanding of the values of protection and empowerment which are the objectives of the legal norm. This condition, has hampered the formation of legal awareness and community legal compliance with the applicable law, it requires the participation of all elements to overcome these problems including public policies formulated by the government must be able to respond to the needs of the community, and carried out continuously as a process to build welfare.

Keywords: Legal Culture, Legal Progressiveness, Legal Values, Poverty.

INTRODUCTION

The conditions of fishermen, fish farmers and salt farmers in Indonesia have not been fully in the level of welfare that suffices many of the problems surrounding their lives. Economic problems become the most crucial problem; this is very contradictory to the geographical conditions of Indonesia as a large country in a strategic area with the mention of an archipelago, which is surrounded by a vast sea. Areas that are very rich with the potential of marine resources are abundant. However, on the other side along the coastline poverty coastal communities can be easily found. Indonesia is recognized as a large country that has promising prospects, natural resources are very diverse, this must be guarded by the regulation and policies that are right on target, there are no gaps in the implementation stage, and are responsive in formulating policy formulations.

The lives of fishermen, fish farmers and salt farmers have their own social problems. There are many factors that reflect why their lives are difficult to develop leading to socio-economic welfare. The problem arises due to limited fisheries resources due to limited mastery of fishing gear technology, degradation of environmental ecosystems in coastal and marine areas, limited human resources, weak alignments and policy support from stakeholders, and weak development support for fishermen, fish farmers and salt farmers (Kusnadi, 2007). The description is emphasized through one example, that fisherman households will always be faced

with three very crucial issues in their lives, namely: (1) struggle to meet the needs of everyday life; (2) faltering in meeting the educational needs of their children; (3) limited access to health insurance. The issue made the Government aware of formulating policies that were directed towards the concept of a progressive vision concept through normalizing the provisions of Law No. 7 of 2016 concerning Protection and Empowerment of Fishermen, Fish Farmers and Salt Farmers (Iqbal, 2012).

These legal provisions must be consistently enforced even though the facts prove that the problem of law enforcement in Indonesia is a major problem in itself that requires in-depth study because law enforcement will involve many components. Sutrisno (2015) stated that

“Indonesia today is faced with a very unique problem of legal performance regarding the formal truth of being treated as the most dominant consideration of legal decision making. An approach that can be used is still in further discussion through a more holistic alternative paradigm”.

It takes extraordinary handling of the law, for which social problems must be dealt with extraordinarily by law and must work extraordinary too (Sutrisno, 2014). The starting point of this thinking departs from the state law's commitment that the state is based on law, that all state activities should be based on law (Yasin, 2014; Sihombing & Lisdiyono, 2018). Especially considering the condition there are 4 (four) legal models, namely first, a very repressive model of colonial law; second, the legal model of development; third, the progressive legal model; and fourth, the integrative legal model. The need for a progressive legal model and integrative law is an attractive solution to overcome the social problems that arise at this time (Atmasasmita, 2012).

The order of legal norms has a central role to realize a prosperous society (Atiyah, 1983). The policies set out in Law No. 7 of 2016 provide protection and empowerment for Fishermen, Fish Farmers and Salt Farmers. This confirms the Government's commitment to lifting the dignity of fishermen's life, fish farmers and salt farmers. The problem that becomes a big question is how is the support of the legal culture of fishermen, fish farmers and salt farmers to understand the legal process of Law No. 7 of 2016. The reason is quite basic by considering that the legal culture component is an important component for law enforcement and culture. Law greatly influences the level of legal awareness and legal compliance of the people who are the target of the legal regulation. It is strong relationship that legal culture is an important component in the process of law enforcement, because legal norms are not in a vacuum but the law is strongly influenced by the socio-economic environment (Lisdiyono & Suatmiati, 2017). In this study the problem is more focused on salt farmers, namely how is the legal culture of salt farmers in understanding legal norms to provide economic protection and empowerment.

THEORETICAL REVIEW

Legal provisions of Law No. 7 of 2016 concerning Protection and Empowerment of Fishermen, Fish Farmers and Salt Farmers as an effort made by the Government to improve the welfare of the community, especially fishermen, fish farmers and salt farmers in a targeted, planned and sustainable manner. In one element, "*weighing*" in the consideration of the law explicitly states that Fishermen, Fish Farmers and Salt Farmers are very dependent on Fish resources, environmental conditions, facilities and infrastructure, business certainty, access to

capital, science, technology, and information so that they need protection and empowerment. This condition is the most basic reason for formulating the policy so that this law is made.

Legal penetration into a society that is so thick, results in demands to make changes and the development of the law itself and its relation to other social problems will also become increasingly intensive (Sutrisno, 2015). Article 1 point 14 of Law No. 7 of 2016 has given a limitation that salt farmers that Salt Farmers are anyone who conducts Salt Business Activities. And Article 1 number 15 of Act Number 7 of 2016 that Small Salt Farmers are Salt Farmers who conduct Salt Business on their own land with a land area of a maximum of 5 (five) hectares, and boiling Salt. Whereas in Article 1 point 16 of Law No. 7 of 2016 regulates Salt Pond Farmers are Salt Farmers who provide energy in the Salting Business, and for the understanding of Salt Pond Owners are Salt Farmers who have rights to the land used for Salt production and actively do Salting Business, this matter is regulated through Article 1 number 17 of Act Number 7 of 2016.

All of these arrangements lead to the commitment of the Government's policy on the importance of the position of salt farmers as a part that has a role in the development process through maximizing the potential of marine resources as an integral part of other resources, especially considering the factors of the island nation rich in natural resources.

The commitment of the Central Government must be balanced with the concern of the Regional Government in formulating local policies through the product of Regional Regulation (PERDA) policies that must be made as soon as possible, especially for areas that are along coastal areas or areas that have the potential to develop salt production. The substance component has to be built to realize law enforcement in real terms, because law enforcement is very dependent on the components of tolerance, structure and legal culture.

The definition of legal culture or legal culture according to Friedman (1975) as the element of social attitude and value, in the process of law as a social institution is expected to be able to fulfill basic human needs for peace, order and tranquility in society. Thus, the law as an institution that exists in the community is interpreted as a container of a legal system that makes the law reaches its goal (Sismarwoto, 2004). For this reason, without legal culture this can easily result in violations of the law in the community. Through normalizing behavior, law enters all aspects of human life, especially providing a framework for the relationships made by members of the community to one another (Sutrisno, 2013). Law is the normative life of the state and its citizens (Ospanova et al., 2017; Yerezhepkyz et al., 2017; Sabirova & Gubaydullin, 2016). Poh Ling Tan about legal culture states that:

“A set of social traditions, attitudes and expectations concerning the law, a legal profession and an independent judiciary, together with respect for these, and the legal internationalization of law and law, procedures and ways of looking at things”.

The meaning of the statement gave birth to two important things, namely the legal culture refers to the existing legal provisions and law enforcement that must proceed, or for other understanding concerning the substance of the legal rules and impartial professional law enforcement officers. The government must be able to give affirmation to the community, the law that is made leads to the interests of the community and oriented towards social justice. Such a concept can be found in the idea of progressive law which states that in general it can be said, that a progressive method of law is based on our own desire and enthusiasm to, not only carry out legal prescriptions, but carry it out with care and meaning. Perhaps it could be called a lawyering compassionate law enforcement, conscience law enforcement (Rahardjo, 2007).

Progressive ways of law people always start with questions like "*is it useful for the people?*"; "*Is that for the people?*"; "*Does it not harm the people?*" The questions flow from the "*law for human*" paradigm (Rahardjo, 2007). Legal products of Law No. 7 of 2016 concerning Protection and Empowerment of Fishermen, Fish Farmers and Salt Farmers as well as the regulation of Law No. 19 of 2013 concerning Farmer Protection and Empowerment are intended to provide benefits to the community, especially fishermen, fish farmers, salt farmers and farmers whose goals are contained through these norms are oriented towards efforts to provide the infrastructure and facilities needed to develop the business, provide business certainty, grow business capacity, build affordable financing institutions, protect from the risk of natural disasters, global climate change and environmental pollution, provide legal protection guarantees. The norms which has a good content refers to the corridor of the interests of the people, so the product of Law No. 7 of 2016 concerning Protection and Empowerment of Fishermen, Fish Farmers and Salt Farmers have a meaningful meaning in the values of progressive legal concepts. Concern about the intended legal purpose leads to building economic structures and economic institutions through legal norms to alleviate poverty, especially salt farmers. Many ways are carried out through Law No. 7 of 2016 as stipulated in Article 4, namely: (1) planning; (2) implementation of protection; (3) organizing empowerment; (4) funding and financing; (5) supervision; (6) society participation.

The legal substance has been well regulated about the protection and empowerment of salt farmers, the content of progressive law has been adopted only that must be considered carefully regarding its legal culture as something very important and difficult to explain or understand, among the three components of the legal system (Tabalujan, 2001). This reason is very well understood considering that different levels of society may have different values, ideas, perceptions and attitudes regarding law as Rosen (2006) states that the law is quite separable from other elements of cultural life. The concept provides confirmation whether the salt farmer community and salt pond farmers have different perspectives or are the same as the legal culture of fishermen or fish farmers, this is important due to almost the same socio-economic conditions among the community. The reason is very logical considering socio-economic conditions such as salt pond farmers who only provide their energy for salvage efforts so that it is very possible for an imbalanced position between capital owners and tenants, work exploitation can occur. The substance component has guaranteed and formulated progressive norms, only an important issue that must be considered the legal awareness factor and the legal compliance of salt farmers to the mutually agreed upon order. The legal purpose of achieving benefits has been realized. Factors of legal awareness and compliance depend heavily on the legal culture possessed by salt farmers to understand the values contained in the contents of Law No. 7 of 2016.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Referring to the "*considering aspects*" on point b in Law No. 7 of 2016, it clearly pays attention to the issues surrounding the fishing community, fish farmers and salt farmers. Thus, through the regulation the government hopes that there will be improvements in socio-economic conditions this is very reasonable because the basis of consideration refers to that in order to realize the goals of the state of prosperity of the people, including fishermen, fish farmers, and salt farmers, the state organizes the Protection and Empowerment of Fishermen, Fish Farmers and Salt Farmers in a planned, directed and sustainable manner. Commitment through a pro-

people policy has been carefully developed only the problem is how then the people capture these opportunities through the realization of a law-based culture that is consistent, positive, creative and constructive so that law enforcement against these normative provisions can work well (Manan, 2005).

Policies for efforts to improve the welfare of the people (Saptomo & Lisdiyono, 2018), especially fishermen, fish farmers and salt farmers which are seen as one of the real policies to change Indonesia's development policy to be oriented to the role of marine resources because it is well aware that the extent of the sea, the potential of the nation must be united to build the welfare of society as a whole. The Government's policy of turning to the economic potential of marine resources has changed the perspective of achieving the concept of welfare state because in previous years Indonesia's development policy was too oriented and more land-based, at the same time, marginalizing roles ocean (maritime orientation) whereas it must be realized that the vast and large potential of the archipelago's marine economy geographically and geopolitically is very strategic. Because of that, there should be huge land and sea potential combined into strengths in building the nation for the welfare of the people (Solihin et al., 2006).

The socio-economic conditions of the salt farmer's community in particular, are not in good condition due to being beaten up with poverty, limited technological mastery, limitations on access to legal policies and economic resources, limitations on information mastery have faced the problem of weak understanding of the values of legal culture positive and constructive. This condition is an obstacle to law enforcement because the component of legal awareness and legal compliance of the community becomes weak. Finally, even though the legal value has referred to the concept of understanding progressive legal values, it is caused by a negative legal culture due to socio-economic problems of law enforcement being neglected. Finally, legal culture can negate law enforcement.

Legal norms of Law No. 7 of 2016 stipulates in Article 1 number 19 that salt is a chemical compound whose main component is sodium chloride and can contain other elements such as magnesium, calcium, iron and potassium with additional ingredients or without iodine additives. Whereas for Article 8 confirms that the Salt Farmers as intended in Article 5 paragraph (1) include: a. small salt farmers; b. farmer of salt ponds; and c. salt pond owners who have more than 5 (five) hectares of land up to 15 (fifteen) hectares. The focus of the study focuses on small salt farmers and salt pond farmers that are widespread throughout the North Java Coast and Madura Island.

In the provisions of Article 1 number 23 of Law No. 7 of 2016 that the business of the trade is an activity carried out with a business system that includes preproduction, production, post-production, processing and marketing, while Article 1 number 25 of the law states that the commodity is proceeds from the Salt Business that can be traded, stored and/or exchanged.

Salt commodities for business development in the regions have good prospects if supported by progressive policies and regulations and followed by a positive and constructive legal culture. Understanding of the values of Law No. 7 of 2016 and followed up through the Regulation of the Minister of Marine and Fisheries of the Republic of Indonesia Number 18/PERMEN-KP/2016 concerning Guarantee of Protection of Risks to Fishermen, Fish Farmers, and Salt Farmers, must be aware of and obeyed by all components involved in efforts to protect and empower small salt farmers and farmers of salt ponds.

Regulation of Law No. 7 of 2016 and Regulation of the Minister of Maritime Affairs and Fisheries of the Republic of Indonesia Number 18/PERMEN-KP/2016 has contained values of

legal progression because the norms that are regulated have a noble value to build the welfare of small salt farming communities and farmers of salt ponds through protection and empowerment efforts, so that it needs to provide protection for risks to small salt farmers and farmers of salt ponds through Salt Insurance.

The value of the concept of Progressive Law in Law No. 7 of 2016 in Article 12 paragraph (2) that the protection strategy is carried out through:

1. Provision of Fisheries and Business Enterprises infrastructure;
2. The ease of obtaining Fisheries Business and Salt Business facilities;
3. Guarantee of business certainty;
4. Risk guarantee of Fishing, Fish Farming and Salting;
5. Elimination of high-cost economic practices;
6. Controlling import of Fisheries Commodities and Salt Commodities;
7. Security and safety guarantee;
8. Facilitation and legal assistance.

Meanwhile, Article 12 paragraph (3) of the law stipulates that the empowerment strategy is carried out through:

1. Education and training;
2. Counseling and mentoring;
3. Business partnership;
4. Ease of access to science, technology and information;
5. Institutional strengthening.

Protection and empowerment efforts carried out by the Government and District/City Government must be understood by small salt farmers and salt pond farmers with an understanding of good, constructive and positive legal values to comply with all agreed arrangements through normalizing positive law. Law No. 7 of 2016 and Regulation of the Minister of Maritime Affairs and Fisheries of the Republic of Indonesia Number 18/PERMEN-KP/2016. The legal culture that was built became one of the components that were very influential for the enforcement of these legal norms.

Existing conditions that surround small salt farmers and farmers of salt ponds in an unfavorable position due to poverty, social lag, disempowerment, vulnerability, physical weakness so that access to legal resources and the economy becomes very limited. And on the other hand, small salt farmers and salt pond farmers are faced with risks that greatly affect the sustainability of their business, as stipulated in Article 30 paragraph (2) of Law No. 7 of 2016 Jo Article 4 paragraph (2) Regulation of the Minister of Marine Affairs and Indonesian Fisheries Number 18/PERMEN-KP/2016 that the risks faced by fishermen, fish farmers and salt farmers as referred to in paragraph (1) include:

1. Lost or damaged means of fishing, fish farming, and salvage efforts;
2. Work accident or loss of life for Fishermen, Fish Farmers, and Salt Farmers;
3. Other types of risk regulated by the Ministerial Regulation.

The causes of these risks, as regulated through legal norms Article 30 paragraph (3) of Law No. 7 of 2016 Jo Article 4 paragraph (3) Regulation of the Minister of Marine and Fisheries of the Republic of Indonesia Number 18/PERMEN-KP/2016 paragraph (2), include:

1. Natural disasters;
2. Fish disease outbreaks;
3. Impacts of climate change;
4. Pollution.

Small salt farmers and salt farm farmers who are faced with the risk of needing protection, this has been given through insurance as stipulated in Article 30 paragraph (5) of Law No. 7 of 2016 Jo Article 5 paragraph (2) Regulation of the Minister of Marine Affairs and Indonesian Fisheries Number 18/PERMEN-KP/2016.

Protection of risks is given in the form of: (1) Fisheries insurance or insurance for work accidents; (2) Life Insurance for loss of life, this is as regulated by Article 30 paragraph (6) of Law No. 7 of 2016 Jo Article 5 paragraph (3) Regulation of the Minister of Marine and Fisheries of the Republic of Indonesia Number 18/PERMEN-KP/2016. Based on the provisions of Article 33 paragraph (1) of Law No. 7 of 2016 Article 9 paragraph (1) Regulation of the Minister of Maritime Affairs and Fisheries of the Republic of Indonesia Number 18/PERMEN-KP/2016 there is a burden to the Central Government in this case the Ministry and Regional Government in accordance with its authority facilitates every Fisherman, Fish Farmer, and Salt Farmer to become Insurance participants.

Provisions in Article 33 paragraph (2) of Law No. 7 of 2016 Jo Article 9 paragraph (2) Regulation of the Minister of Marine and Fisheries of the Republic of Indonesia Number 18/PERMEN-KP/2016 that facilities provided include:

1. Ease of registration to become a participant;
2. Ease of access to insurance companies;
3. Dissemination of insurance programs to fishermen, Fish Farmers, and Salt Farmers and insurance companies;
4. Assistance for life insurance premium payments, Fisheries Insurance, or Insurance for Small Fishermen, Traditional Fishermen, Small Fish Farmers and Small Salt Farmers in accordance with the country's financial capability.

Another aspect that must be considered for poverty alleviation and welfare development is through empowerment because conceptual poverty reduction efforts can be carried out by four strategic pathways, namely expansion of opportunities, community empowerment, capacity building and social protection. And Law No. 7 of 2016 in particular Article 44 has confirmed the regulation of the Central Government and Regional Government in accordance with its authority responsible for the Empowerment of Fishermen, Fish Farmers and Salt Farmers through a defined empowerment strategy (Wrihatnolo & Dwidjowijoto, 2007).

The legal progress that has been built must be upheld through the component of legal culture because the process of law enforcement is very dependent on three basic components, namely substance, structure and legal culture. The substance through legislative products that have been made supported by a legal structure that has a good legal attitude becomes a strong recipient for law enforcement and on the other hand, it must also be considered the elements of community legal culture.

Community of small salt farming communities and salt pond farmers where habitat for legal norms Law No. 7 of 2016 and Regulation of the Minister of Marine and Fisheries of the Republic of Indonesia Number 18/PERMEN-KP/2016 live must have a positive legal culture so that legal awareness and legal compliance with the order the legal norm can be achieved. The

problem is that the law does not work in a vacuum, but the law is strongly influenced by various sub-systems, including social-economic sub-systems so that the poverty of small salt farmers and salt-fish farmers who only have the power to provide their own salvage business is the main obstacle to enforcing legal norms Law No. 7 of 2016 and Regulation of the Minister of Maritime Affairs and Fisheries of the Republic of Indonesia Number 18/PERMEN-KP/2016.

The protection and empowerment that is carried out requires the involvement of policy stakeholders including the Central Government and the District/City Regional Government, the burden of responsibility is not easy to implement because the conditions of each region in Indonesia are very diverse. Potential capability of each region depends heavily on the Regional Own-Source Revenue (PAD) obtained, one form of risk protection that must be considered is life insurance premium payment assistance, Insurance for small salt farmers this clearly requires an in-depth study in accordance with the finances in the area and the culture of small salt farmers in the context of living an understanding of the importance of insurance so that they must pay a premium. In other aspects, poverty and limited information about insurance have given rise to contradictory views, how to pay a temporary insurance premium to meet the needs of daily living alone is still very difficult. This social reality has resulted in the birth of a legal culture that is apathetic, pessimistic and ignores the values contained in Law No. 7 of 2016 and Regulation of the Minister of Marine and Fisheries of the Republic of Indonesia No. 18/PERMEN-KP/2016. Legal awareness and legal compliance with legal norms are very low. As a result, the legal objectives for justice, legal certainty and the benefits of law are difficult to achieve.

CONCLUSION

The legal order made through Law No. 7 of 2016 and the Regulation of the Minister of Maritime Affairs and Fisheries of the Republic of Indonesia Number 18/PERMEN-KP/2016 has contained the values of the concept of progressive law for community welfare, social justice and sustainable economic development and with regard to local wisdom values. The implementation of the legal order in the law enforcement process is strongly influenced by elements of legal culture, not only by paying attention to the substance and structure elements. Legal culture of small salt farmers and farmers of salt ponds that are negative, apathetic due to socio-economic factors of poverty have placed a weak position to build legal awareness and legal compliance, even though the two positive legal arrangements are Law No. 7 of 2016 and Regulation The Minister of Maritime Affairs and Fisheries of the Republic of Indonesia Number 18/PERMEN-KP/2016 has provided sufficient space for poverty alleviation through protection and empowerment programs through insurance, business partnerships, making it easier to access science and technology and institutional strengthening. The progressive values must be balanced by building a positive, constructive and creative legal culture, so that in the end the law enforcement process does not only depend on the substance and structure components but the legal culture component has an important role.

REFERENCE

- Atiyah, P.S. (1983). *Law and modern society*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Atmasasmita, R. (2012). Three legal paradigms in national development. *Prioris Law Journal Trisakti University Faculty of Law*, 3(1), 1-15.
- Friedman, L.M. (1975). *The legal system a social science perspective*. New York: Russell Sage Foundation.

- Kusnadi. (2007). *Social security of fishermen*. Yogyakarta: LkiS.
- Lisdiyono, E., & Suatmiati, S. (2017). Socio-political and economic aspects in legal context. *European Research Studies*, 20(4), 149-157.
- Manan, A. (2005). *Legal changing aspects*. Prenada Media, Jakarta.
- Ospanova, D., Kussainov, D., Suleimanov, A., Kussainova, A., & Abilsheyeva, R. (2017). Problems of administrative law in the system of public administration. *Journal of Legal, Ethical and Regulatory Issues*, 20(2), 1-6.
- Rahardjo, S. (2007). *Let the law flow the critical note on human struggle and law*. Jakarta: Kompas.
- Rahardjo, S. (2007). Discussing adult law science. *Paper working meeting of the Indonesian PTN Faculty of Law Dean*. Semarang.
- Rosen, L. (2006). *Law as culture*. Princeton University Press.
- Sabirova, L.L., & Gubaydullin, A.R. (2016). The improvement of legal procedure of state strategies implementation in the Russian federation. *Journal of Legal, Ethical and Regulatory Issues*, 19(SI), 37-43.
- Saptomo, A., & Lisdiyono, E. (2018). Alternative dispute settlement regarding investment in some Asia Pacific countries. *European Research Studies Journal*, 21(2), 77-82.
- Sihombing, B.F., & Lisdiyono, E. (2018). Governance and the role of legal aspects in the fuel pricing in Indonesia. *International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy*, 8(3), 168-176.
- Sismarwoto, E. (2004). Gaps in legal empowerment in society (Legal and community theoretical analysis). *Jurnal Hukum*, 14(3), 1-15.
- Solihin, A., Karim, A., Suhana, N.T. (2005). *Indonesian maritime and fisheries development strategy (Bunga Rampai)*. Bandung: Humaniora.
- Iqbal, M. (2012). Illegal fishing as a corporate crime a breakthrough in criminal law in dealing with crime. *Legal and Judicial Journals*, 1(3), 417-434.
- Sutrisno, E. (2013). *Reconstruction of the law culture of fishermen's communities to build fishermen's welfare: Critical study of legal meaning*. Yogyakarta: Genta Press.
- Sutrisno, E. (2014). Implementation of coastal resource management based on coastal area management in an integrated manner for the welfare of fishermen. *Jurnal Dinamika Hukum*, 14(1), 78-92.
- Sutrisno, E. (2015). *Bunga rampai hukum dan globalisasi*. Bogor: In-Media.
- Sutrisno, E. (2015). Tracing the performance of law in Indonesia (A perspective of Thomas Kuhn's normal science). *Journal of Law, Policy and Globalization, International Institute for Science, Technology & Education Accelerating Global Knowledge Creation and Sharing*, 37(126), 1896-1915.
- Tabalujan, B.S. (2001). *Legal development in developing countries the role of legal culture, division of business law*. Singapore: Nanyang Business School.
- Wrihatnolo, R.R., & Dwidjowijoto, R.D. (2007). *Empowerment management an introduction and guide to community empowerment*. Jakarta: PT Elex Media Komputindo Kelompok Gramedia,
- Yasin, R. (2014). Review of the constitutional court's decision in the 2004 presidential election dispute (Perspective of constitutional democratic state). *Jurnal Konstitusi*, 11(4), 1-10.
- Yerezhpekzy, R., Karatayeva, A., Kuanalieva, G.A., Konysbai, B.M., & Azhinurina, D.A. (2017). Legal regulation of public access to information in the field of environmental protection and use of natural resources. *Journal of Legal, Ethical and Regulatory Issues*, 20(2), 1-9.